Mission, the Divine/Human Enterprise

A handsomely produced volume recently reached our desk. Edited by an admired colleague and boasting a roster of expert authors for its several chapters, it offers a fresh world history of Christianity. The controlling idea behind its planning and production was to provide a history of Christianity that would be truly global in scope, avoiding the tendency of most such histories to invest the largest share of attention on Europe and North America. For that focus it is most welcomed.

But one can hardly see, through the prism used by the authors, that the Christian God has had much to do with the history of the global community that names Jesus Christ as Lord. It's all just history—documentation of the varied, fascinating, mixed phenomena of human actions, of social movements, of upheavals, retreats, advances, and declines on the human stage. Everything seems autonomous and, well, haphazard, explained entirely by the actors on the world stage.

The opening feature of this issue challenges such a flattened view of mission and the church. Gary McGee, a contributing editor, confronts mission historians with evidence that the Lord of the church has been playing a direct role all along. McGee also analyzes why even conservative scholars often have hesitated to give credit to the miraculous and timely interventions of God in the advance of the Gospel. Of course mission is a human enterprise, but certainly it is no less the result of an attentive providence. (See Heb. 1:1-2.)

The interplay of the divine and the human is obvious also in Eugene Heideman’s account of the struggle of women missionaries in late nineteenth-century India to advance their sense of call in the face of obstacles rooted in the patriarchal assumptions of mission administrators—all males at the time.

Maina Chawla Singh follows with an essay reflecting an unusual line of research. Noting how women missionaries from America often gave home constituencies negative pictures of the peoples and culture of India, she uncovers the surprisingly fond and positive memories that Hindu women had of their missionary teachers—memories, she writes, that “did not mesh nicely with the themes of domination and oppression, and of resistance and subversion that my understanding of postcolonial theories of race and power pointed to.”

Not everyone will see God’s hand in mission. But in our postmodern age, maybe the historian of mission can afford to be at least cautiously open to evidence from beyond the global stage.
Miracles and Mission Revisited

Gary B. McGee

In 1839 Alexander Duff, the renowned Scottish missionary to India, wrote about the role of Christian education in training indigenous teachers and preachers of the Gospel. With such an aim, said Duff, “Missionaries of the Church of Scotland have been sent forth . . . in the absence of miracles.” Teaching school in Calcutta, he was apparently unaware of what other missionaries working in Burma (now Myanmar) were experiencing during the same period in their work among the Karens. Venturing into the mountains, Jonathan and Deborah Wade lost their way until they came upon a Karen house. An elderly man sitting on the veranda gazed on them for a few moments in silence and then called out, “The teacher has arrived; the teacher has arrived!” Soon a crowd from the neighborhood gathered, for converts were baptized, and a permanent mission station established.

Yet, while the educational legacy of Duff has been endlessly recounted in histories of missions, few people today know about the miraculous events surrounding the introduction of the Christian faith in Myanmar. Historians of missions and missiologists have generally ignored these kinds of reports, ironically crucial pieces to the puzzle of how Christianity developed in non-Western countries. Consequently, this exclusion has seriously limited the insights of historical and missiological analysis. To correct misapprehended interpretations, such stories must be considered. Historians may have reservations about the wide-angle lens of providential narratives, but they cannot afford to crop them out of the picture.

In light of discussions in the last several years about how the history of Christianity in the former mission lands should be written, as well as interest in the phenomenology of religion among non-Western peoples, this inquiry briefly explores selected claims of paranormal happenings. It then analyzes why the anticipation of miracles declined, examines views in the Protestant missionary community on the possibility and importance of miracles, and recounts what historians have said or failed to say about them in textbooks. While historians and missiologists have examined aspects of how the Christian message was inserted into various cultures and the level of acceptance it gained, the specific relationship of miracles to missions and how missionaries and mission leaders perceived their importance have been neglected.

Pre-Reformation Claims

Precedent for miracles in missions is found from the time of the apostles. However, their credibility has long generated disagreement in the West because of historical, theological, and philosophical considerations. Questions about sources, as well as the obvious ideological agendas of the authors who controlled the evaluation of evidence, have naturally and rightly troubled modern historians. Theological and philosophical presuppositions have been of no less importance in the debate. The theological issue has centered in part on whether miracles fulfilled their purpose in the first century. “No transition in the history of the Church [was] so sudden, abrupt, and radical as that from the apostolic to the post-apostolic age,” wrote the German Reformed historian Philip Schaff. And then in a pronouncement of virtually ex cathedra proportions, he declared: “God himself . . . established an impassable gulf. . . . The apostolic age is the age of miracles.” Presbyterians and historical Benjamin B. Warfield concurred. In his judgment the extraordinary “gifts of power” of the apostles had served to authenticate them as the “authoritative founders” of the church. In turn, they conferred this capability on their own disciples. But as the latter gradually passed off the scene, so did the demonstrations of miraculous power. Despite Anglican attempts to defend the occurrences of miracles into the patristic age, Warfield would have none of it. In his estimation, the “great harvest of miracles” that came with the evolution of Roman Catholicism grew from the tares of “heathendom.”

In recent years historians have challenged this thesis, including Stanley M. Burgess and Kilian McDonnell, O.S.B., who have reviewed the evidence and located new sources of information. Burgess insists that “cessationists” like Warfield failed to look objectively at the Roman Catholic and Eastern Orthodox traditions. None of the early church fathers suggested that miracles and the charismata had been intended only for the New Testament church. In his analysis of patristic sources, McDonnell finds that the charisms of the Holy Spirit, including the gifts of tongues and prophecy, were sought for and received during the rites of Christian initiation (baptism, confirmation, Eucharist). Evidence provided by witnesses from around the Mediterranean seaboard extends from the end of the second to the eighth centuries.

More directly related to missions, records attest to supernatural demonstrations of power in the advance of Christianity, with some analogous to phenomena found in the New Testament. For instance, Basil of Cappadocia lauded the remarkable number of conversions in the ministry of Gregory Thaumaturgus (“wonder-worker”), a third-century missionary bishop in Asia Minor. “By the superabundance of gifts, wrought in him by the Spirit in all power and in signs and marvels,” Basil reported, Gregory “was styled a second Moses by the very enemies of the Church.” In Egypt the fourth-century desert father Antony became legendary for his prevailing in conflicts with demons, his feats being attributed to fidelity to Nicene Christology.

In the same era Nino, a slave girl taken captive to the Caucasus region and afterward canonized by the Orthodox

Historians cannot afford to crop miracles out of the story of missions.
Church of Georgia with the title “Equal to the Apostles,” prayed for the healing of Queen Nana. The queen in fact recovered, which contributed to the conversion of King Mirian and the nation. The connection of a physical healing or some other kind of miraculous incident to the conversion of an individual, tribe, or nation can be found elsewhere, from that of the Ethiopian eunuch in the Book of Acts (8:26–40), to the third-century King Tiridates of Armenia, to the fourth-century Emperor Constantine, to the fifth-century Clovis, king of the Franks, all the way to the mid-twentieth-century conversion of Gypsies in France.

While much can be said for the basic reliability of these stories, such accounts were sometimes transformed into fantastic tales. It happened in the case of Patrick of Ireland. Though he himself credited his escape from captivity and his calling to evangelize to the influence of voices and dreams, later accretions distorted his actual ministry.

Medieval reports reflect the same problem. In Britain the Venerable Bede, the eighth-century father of English history, recorded miracles that purportedly took place during the evangelization of England. Stories of healings, exorcisms, calming of the sea, raising the dead, signs in the heavens, and other unusual occurrences lie sprinkled throughout his History of the English Church and People.

Responding to reports about Augustine of Canterbury and his fellow monks who were evangelizing the country, Pope Gregory the Great (590–604) praised their achievements and said they stood “resplendent with such great miracles … that they seem to imitate the powers of the apostles in the signs which they display.” To Gregory and others in the ancient and medieval periods, no “impassable gulf” separated them from the early church.

Reformation and Later Perspectives

With the coming of the Protestant Reformation, the reformers Martin Luther, Huldrych Zwingli, and John Calvin disavowed the Catholic doctrine of the communion of saints. In so doing, they brushed aside the value set on the saints, holy relics, pilgrimages, shrines, and the miracle stories that developed around them. Generally speaking, they believed that miracles had vanished with the apostolic church, a view shared by the post-Reformation Lutheran and Reformed scholastic theologians as well. In clearing away what they considered to be the debris of medieval Catholicism, they rejected the miracle claims. One could trust in the veracity of the biblical miracles, but none afterward. Thus, Calvin contended that both Catholics and Anabaptists sought to certify their false doctrines with spurious claims of miracles. Luther faced a challenge from charismatic prophets who insisted that God had given them new revelations, which they viewed as superior to Scripture.

In the great bombardment of reason against Scripture and tradition in the late seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, the Enlightenment, or Age of Reason, aimed its fusillades of skepticism on anything deemed miraculous, whether found in Scripture or in popular religion. Humankind had only now come of age thanks to the liberation of rational thinking from superstition. Hence, whether from the teachings of the Reformers or the disbelief of the rationalists, confidence in the possibility of supernatural interventions declined or was eliminated altogether in the minds of many people.

Evangelical Christians also waded into the intellectual currents of the time. Evangelical faith and features of Enlightenment thought, coupled with the notion that the spirit of investigation...
should be encouraged and proceed without restrictions, seemed to pave the way for the future of Christianity. When launching into missions, pietists and evangelicals remained true to their theological convictions by preaching to secure “heartfelt” conversions and exhibited their optimism about human progress by pressing their educational and social agenda. Like Duff, they did not anticipate that miracles would accompany the verbal proclamation of the Gospel as in apostolic times. Therefore, the likelihood of divine displays of power rarely appeared in discourses on mission practices.

At the same time, revivalism in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries brought heightened interest in the person and work of the Holy Spirit, a development that gradually focused on the baptism and charismatic gifts of the Spirit. The attention given to pneumatology by the nineteenth-century Wesleyan and Keswickian wings of the Holiness movement stirred people to seek for the fulfillment of Joel’s prophecy (Joel 2:28-29) to supply the spiritual energy necessary to bring about societal reform and evangelize the world. Inadvertently, revivalism also opened the door to controversial forms of behavior and phenomena that frequently came with experiential piety, including falling down “under the power” of the Holy Spirit, dancing, shaking, cries, and groans, as well as visions, dreams, and signs in the heavens. To the faithful, they too were of divine origin and constituted valid spiritual experiences. Though notably absent in the histories of missions, reports of extraordinary experiences found their way into chronicles of revivals, books that sometimes round out a more accurate picture of events in the mission lands. Unfortunately, the sources for these publications have been underutilized for mission studies.

Paranormal occurrences often profoundly affected the reception of the Christian faith and stimulated spiritual renewal in believers. Records and publications from nineteenth- and twentieth-century Protestant missions contain stories of miracles and related experiences. Primary sources such as autobiographies, periodicals, reports, and agency histories occasionally provide treasures of information. In some instances missionaries considered the miracles to be pretended and the bodily contortions to be caused by “animal excitement.” Their appeal could stem only from “weaknesses incidental to human nature, especially among a people unaccustomed to exercise self-control”—a perspective revealing that missionaries and indigenous peoples lived worldviews apart.

In most publications the supernatural dynamics that propelled the early church took a back seat to other priorities. For most Protestants the postmillennial calendar with its hopefulness of Christianizing society nurtured the belief that after an extended period of progress, Christ would return. In the meantime mission schools trained students in Western learning so they would see the light of Christianity and ultimately embrace the faith. Theoretically, civilizing and evangelizing would work hand in hand to lead them out of heathen darkness. Nevertheless, unplanned events frequently interrupted the process. Following on the heels of revivals in America and northern Ireland, “a very remarkable revival of religion” took place in Jamaica in 1860 that impacted the entire island. Lengthy prayer services that set aside fixed liturgical practices, seekers being “stricken” or prostrated on the ground presumably by the might of God, and public confessions of sin marked the awakening. Impressive results ensued. Many “rum-shops” and gambling houses closed, separated spouses reconciled, wayward children returned to their parents, ministers grew in spiritual zeal, sinners were converted, churches became crowded, and the demand for Bibles exceeded supplies. According to Richard Lovett, historian of the London Missionary Society, “A movement of this kind among a dense population of semi-civilized, excitable negroes was certain to produce extravagances and much that was repugnant to quiet, unemotional people” (an allusion to unsympathetic missionaries and other Euramerican residents). But, continues Lovett, “The testimony of men of sober judgment is that at least 20,000 souls were savingly awakened at this period. The missionaries on the spot believed it to be a special outpouring of the Holy Spirit in response to prayer.”

Such events could prove threatening to established Western doctrines and practices. When news of the same revivals reached South India in 1860, Christians in Tinnevelly (now Tirunelveli) experienced similar phenomena. The revival there prompted believers to evangelize and fostered local modes of worship. Initial approval, however, waned as claims about the restoration of New Testament gifts (Rom. 12:6-8; 1 Cor. 12 and 14) and offices (Eph. 4:11-12) exasperated missionaries, whose status and authority now came into question. On one occasion, a missionary complained that believers reported having visions in which appeared the names of twelve Indians to be appointed as apostles and evangelists, and seven as prophets. To indigenous Christians, such revelations happily demonstrated God’s willingness to bypass imported ecclesiastical structures in the appointment of church leaders.

The calling of John Stewart, an American of mixed European and African descent, illustrates how supernatural factors could direct a person’s life and impact other people. While living in Virginia, he heard the voice of a man and then of a woman “from the sky” say to him, “Thou shalt go to the Northwest and declare my counsel plainly.” Afterward, a “peculiar halo” became visible and filled the Western horizon. Traveling to the northwest region of Ohio, he began preaching to the Wyandott Indians with great success in 1816. As a result, Stewart’s example helped inspire the establishment of the Methodist Missionary Society four years later, an agency whose personnel eventually circled the globe. The appearance of a halo—an ancient pagan symbol adopted by early Christians and used in the depiction of angels, saints, and the Virgin Mary—combined with what seemed to be masculine and feminine voices of God, denotes the blending of popular and biblical modes of piety that made “respectable” Christians cringe.

Textbook Histories

The period of the Enlightenment, which preceded the “Great Century” (1800-1914) in Christian missions, left no room in its worldview for the traditional New Testament understanding of miracles or for a recognition of the supernatural activities that characterized the expansion of the ancient and medieval churches. The new vision of Christianity resonated with a strong ethical
orientation, acceptable to the emerging Western mind-set and freed of the superstitions of the "prescientific" era. Moreover, this view dictated that history be written with complete objectivity, scientific in methodology and interpretation.31 As Mark Noll observes, "Christian historians took their place in the modern academy by treating history not so much as a subdivision of theology but as an empirical science. This choice meant that they have constructed their historical accounts primarily from facts ascertained through documentary or material evidence and explained in terms of natural human relationships."32

The end result becomes tangible in standard histories and surveys of missions, in required texts in Bible institutes, colleges, universities, and seminaries, which rarely mention miracles.33 The word "miracle" seldom appears in the indexes. One looks in vain for "healing," "exorcisms," "dreams," and "visions." "Revival" sporadically surfaces, and the information given may briefly describe the unusual phenomena sometimes associated with such movements. A few indexes contain "apostolic methods." I have selected several publications to illustrate the penchant of Protestant missiologists and historians of missions to ignore or underrate what were in fact vital factors in the development of Christianity in the non-Christian world. Whether they personally believed that miracles could happen or happened the way they were reported remains beside the point; the issue centers on the data they chose to include and the meaning they attached to it.

In 1884 the best-known German missiologist and historian of missions, Gustav Warneck, published his Outline of a History of Protestant Missions from the Reformation to the Present Time. In the introduction he refers to the apostolic age as the "heroic age of early Christianity . . . the age of classical missionary enterprise, a model for missions in all ages." Still, he neglects to cite the miracles associated with the ministries of Jesus and the apostles. In retrospect, he notes that the periods of apostolic, postapostolic, and medieval missions had been sovereignly opened and closed. Modern missions was thus shorn of any miraculous dimension.34

Edwin Munsell Bliss, a former missionary to the Middle East with the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM), also avoids reference to New Testament miracles in The Missionary Enterprise: A Concise History of Its Methods, and Extension (1908). Oddly enough, he mentions Gregory Thaumaturgus because of Gregory's reputation for performing miracles.35 In contrast, Philip Schaff questions the "stupendous" claims about Gregory in his History of the Christian Church (1858–92) and makes a point of noting that they were recorded one hundred years after his death. "Deducting all the marvelous features, which the magnifying distance of one century after the death of the saint created," he writes, "there remains the commanding figure of a great and good man who made a most powerful impression upon his and the subsequent generations."36 For Schaff, a downsized "good man" more appropriately fit the modern era.

William Owen Carver, a Southern Baptist missions historian, begins his Course of Christian Missions: A History and an Interpretation (1932) with a presentation of the biblical foundations of mission. Without discussing the miracles of Jesus, he briefly refers to the signs and wonders done by the apostles. The focus then predictably shifts to expansion, agencies, and the social, educational, and medical benefits of missions.37 Paradoxically, in the year after its publication, Southern Baptists in North America learned about a revival at their North China Mission in Shandong Province, where, according to Mary K. Crawford in her Shantung Revival (1933), "the sick are being healed; devils cast out; men and women, boys and girls are preaching with a power hitherto not known; hundreds are crying for mercy and are being saved." From this revival also arose the independent spiritual gifts movement, the influence of which has continued in the region to the present day.38

From a different vantage point, V. Raymond Edman, a missionary to Ecuador with the Christian and Missionary Alliance and later president of Wheaton College, Illinois, barely hints of miracles in the progress of the early church in his volume Light in Dark Ages: Eighteen Centuries of Missions from the Giving of the Great Commission to the Beginning of Modern Missions Under William Carey (1949). A similar approach appears in The Progress of World-Wide Missions (1924), a best-selling history and survey of missions written by Robert Hall Glover, a medical missionary to China with the Alliance and later U.S. home director of the China Inland Mission. He describes the New Testament as the "most practical textbook on missionary principles and practice for all time." The methods of Jesus and the apostles, Glover wrote, though necessitating "reasonable adaptation," constitute the best and most effective strategies still used in modern missions.39

For Glover, as for Edman, revival held the key to evangelization: the "pentecostal experience of the Holy Spirit's infilling has been the forerunner of every fresh missionary inspiration and advance in the centuries" since the Day of Pentecost. Nevertheless, while Glover highlights the importance of a postconversion baptism in the Holy Spirit for empowerment to witness and favorably mentions several miraculous events in the missions of the ancient church, he ignores later claims.40 He does so, despite his association with the Alliance, which took one of the most extreme positions on the value of prayer for the sick in the work of missions.41

More than other historians, Kenneth Scott Latourette analyzes the issue of miracles in his History of the Expansion of Christianity (1937–45). Acknowledging the scholarly debate about

Gustav Warneck, noting the period of apostolic mission was sovereignly closed, effectively dismissed the possibility of miracles having a role in modern missions.
the Christian World Mission (1978), Kane favorably mentions in reference to Gregory Thaumaturgus that “the transition from paganism to Christianity was facilitated by the widespread use of miracles.” He also comments on the importance of miracles of healing in the growth of Latin American Pentecostalism. But apart from these fleeting remarks, the Concise History has the same orientation as the other books. Yet in his Twofold Growth (1947), published thirty-one years earlier when he still served in China, he acknowledges from firsthand observation that “hundreds of our finest Christians in the Fowyang field entered the Christian fold by way of the miracle gate. They were driven to Christ not by a sense of sin, but by a sense of need.” The “needs” usually preceded the sense of culpability for sin: “A parent with a sick child, a husband with a demon-possessed wife, a woman with an opium-smoking husband, a widow bowed down by oppression, a soldier with an infected foot, a merchant whose only son had been kidnapped, an aged father with an unfilial son, a bandit serving a prison term.” "Where the need for miracles exists—as it surely does in heathen lands,” Kane recalls, God “always responds with alacrity.” What was appropriate for Twofold Growth, however, did not qualify for the Concise History.

**Factors Prompting Exclusion**

Several factors lie behind the exclusion of supernatural claims, among them the underlying historiographical presuppositions in the academy that do not allow for speculation about metaphysical cause and effect. Mission historians generally adhered to the established rules of their profession. In a reflection of his central thesis about the history of Christian expansion, Latourette writes: “It is clear that at the very beginning of Christianity there must have occurred a vast release of energy, unequalled in the history of the race. Without it the future course of the faith is inexplicable.” “Why this occurred,” he cautions his readers, “may lie outside the realms in which historians are supposed to move.”

Together with other objectives, the textbook histories informed their readers about the movement of Christianity throughout the world. They were often crafted to portray missions in a positive light and to inspire their readers toward deeper Christian devotion, to contribute to missions, or to become missionaries themselves. Drawing attention to controversial aspects of religious enthusiasm might deflect from the credibility of the

---

**Adrian Hastings Remembered**


Adrian Hastings, who died after a short illness while still at the peak of his intellectual powers, was one of the great ecumenical thinkers of our age. In particular, his contribution to the study of Christianity in Africa is immense, important both for its grasp of detail and complexity and for its ability to place the African story decisively within the history of Christianity as a whole.

Born into an English Catholic family, Hastings studied for the priesthood in Rome in the early 1950s. Determined to work as a missionary in Africa, he encountered in Rome a generation of young African ordinands, such as the theologian Vincent Mulago of the Democratic Republic of Congo, who were to have an impact on the flowering of an African Catholic theology in the era of African independence and Vatican II. Already a radical in social and political matters, Hastings had the temerity and inner confidence, even as a student, to enter into a sharp debate with apologists of the Salazar regime of Portugal. Hastings argued with measured rationality, but also with passionate commitment, against identifying the Catholic faith with the survival of Portuguese power in Goa.

Espousing the aspirations of the African priests he knew in Rome, Hastings persuaded the authorities to allow him to go to Africa as a parish priest under a local bishop rather than as a member of a missionary order. From 1958 he worked in Masaka diocese in Uganda, whose diocesan, Bishop Joseph Kiwanuka, was the first African Catholic bishop ordained in modern times. After a period in parochial work at Villa Maria, Hastings became a teacher at Bukalasa minor seminary, many of whose students later made significant contributions to Ugandan Catholicism and to public life. In 1966 the East African bishops entrusted him with the task of producing commentaries on the documents of Vatican II, interpreting them in the context of the life of the church in East Africa. This task of considerable missiological and pastoral significance ensured that Hastings was deeply involved in the transformation of Catholicism as it sought to embody African values and voice African concerns. He was subsequently able to apply those insights ecumenically in his study on Christian marriage in Africa, commissioned by the Anglican churches of eastern and southern Africa.

In the early 1970s Hastings crossed swords again with the Portuguese regime, this time over its record of repression in its African colonies. He publicized information about massacres at Wiriyamu in Mozambique, in the process developing a formidable indictment of Portuguese policy in Africa, not least the pretensions of its civilizing and Christianizing mission.

By this time Hastings had become a research fellow at the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) in London. He took part in a comprehensive symposium, held in Jos, Nigeria, on Christianity in independent Africa. This gathering resulted in the 1978 collection of essays Christianity in Independent Africa, which Hastings helped to compile. His fellowship also resulted in his book, A History of African Christianity, 1950–1975 (1979), which so well captured the excitement of those years of upheaval and optimism, and the subsequent anxieties, in a period when Christianity took on a new centrality and relevance for African society. From SOAS Hastings went to Aberdeen, as lecturer in religious studies, where Andrew Walls was professor.

Hastings had become acutely aware of the problems that

---

Kevin Ward is Lecturer in the Department of Theology and Religious Studies, University of Leeds.
missions movement itself before incredulous Western audiences. The top-down coverage also looked primarily to the missionaries and their stories, not to the native believers who had entered the faith from non-Christian religions and were more prone to accept the legitimacy of paranormal phenomena. Finally, skeptical assumptions about the possibility of miracles after the apostolic period—a stance reinforced among Protestants by negative attitudes toward Roman Catholic miracle stories like the reputed healings at the shrine of Lourdes—clouded the authenticity of all such accounts.51 Consequently, gaps appear in the textbook narratives due in part to the absence of reports about unusual phenomena. Despite making valuable contributions, the legacy of the miraculous has been neglected in Western interpretations of events and spiritual dynamics that shaped Christianity outside Euro-America. Modern writers have perpetuated this sanitized approach by highlighting the development of mission societies, geographic extension, and charitable, educational, and social achievements (e.g., Stephen Neill, A History of Christian Missions [1964]); they generally offer limited insight into the spirituality of indigenous Christians.

Theologians of mission have also overlooked the missiological importance of miraculous happenings in their historical analyses (e.g., David J. Bosch, Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission [1991]). The pattern of ignoring or minimizing the worth of paranormal phenomena turns history into a broadcast where only carefully screened “instant replays” can be seen, filtering out other plays equally important to the game. The exclusion of the full range of intercultural dynamics thus produces an incomplete picture of what actually took place.52

Five General Views

Missionaries and their supporters at the home base have held at least five views toward miracles (with some overlapping of categories). However, textbooks and other mission studies seldom treat the diversity of opinions held by Protestant missionaries and mission leaders, whose judgments ranged from outright rejection to hesitation to unbridled enthusiasm. First, those with a progressive or liberal theological persuasion blurred the definitions of “natural” and “supernatural.” Since the exorcism of particularism.

an insistence on clerical celibacy created for African Catholicism. In 1979 Hastings himself made the decision, difficult for a Catholic priest, to marry. His wife, Ann, an Anglican, had grown up in Southern Rhodesia and worked for the Anglican mission society United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel. Between 1982 and 1985 they lived in the newly independent state of Zimbabwe, where Hastings had gone to be professor of religious studies at Harare University. There he wrote his influential account of twentieth-century English Christianity.

In 1985 he was appointed professor in Leeds. His energetic leadership resulted in a growth in student numbers and in the international reputation of the Department of Theology and Religious Studies. The study of religion in Africa was initiated, strengthening the university’s wide interests in development studies and in the politics and literature of Africa. During these years he wrote his magnum opus on Africa, The Church in Africa, 1450–1950 (1994). As editor of Journal of Religion in Africa (in succession to its founder, Andrew Walls), he saw the journal grow in strength and prestige. It has become a leading forum for innovative research on Christianity, Islam, and traditional religion in Africa. The present editor, David Maxwell, and Ingrid Lawrie (who gave Hastings invaluable secretarial support), have produced a Festschrift entitled Christianity and the African Imagination: Essays in Honour of Adrian Hastings (2001). The continuing vitality of Hastings’s own intellectual concerns are shown in the fact that, after retiring in 1994, he assumed direction of two important projects: A World History of Christianity (1999) and the Oxford Companion to Christian Thought (2000). He provided much of the dynamic and the intellectual rationale for both enterprises. During the Leeds years, Hastings had also been a leading campaigner on the Balkans. He became particularly associated with the struggle in Bosnia to preserve traditions of ethnic and religious diversity within a single state, against all narrow particularism.

Hastings’s writing is characterized by a remarkable scope and penetration. He was able to summarize a movement, a person, or an era with great lucidity and perceptiveness. His writings on Africa have an intense humanity, a strong identification with the hopes and sufferings of his subjects, whether Catholic, Protestant, Orthodox (he had a fascination for the Church in Ethiopia), or members of independent, African instituted, churches. His portraits of individuals and of religious societies are masterful, both in illuminating their importance and in placing them within a wider historical movement. His corpus of historical writing on Africa was completed before the full extent of the newer African Pentecostalism could properly be assessed historically, but one can be sure that he would have applied an equal perspicacity and broad sympathy to these significant developments.

Hastings wrote, as he lectured, with great clarity and economy, rationality and commitment. He was impatient of obfuscating theorizing; his writing has directness and readability, and yet it springs from an intellectual depth and sophistication, both methodologically and conceptually. Hastings was convinced that the history of African Christianity is an integral part of the total history of Christianity. For him Africa was important not simply because of its evangelistic dynamism but for the intellectual and imaginative contribution it makes to world Christianity. As he put it in one of the last things he wrote before his death: “But what matters even more is the emergence into full vitality of still larger Churches in the southern continents of Latin America, Africa, and Asia. Upon them may the future third millennium of Christianity depend.”

—Kevin Ward

Adrian Hastings’s “My Pilgrimage in Mission” was published in the International Bulletin of Missionary Research, April 1992, pp. 60–64. Ed.
signs which reveal a Power supreme in nature and in history. The supernatural may be seen everywhere," penned Robert A. Hume in Dnyanodaya, the Anglo-Marathi newspaper published by the Ahmednagar Mission (ABCFM) in India. "The signs which reveal a Power supreme in nature and in history [direct] the universe toward an end. The supernatural is nothing else but the spiritual working through the medium of physical nature."53 Another editorial speculated that if "competent physicians and specialists in nervous diseases" had examined the "cases of supposed ‘demonical possession’ which have taken place in India within the last few years,” they would have recognized them as "forms of disease well-known and described in medical books."54 The progress of medical science would inevitably lead to a better understanding of Jesus’ ministry of healing and signal an advance over the traditional claims about New Testament miracles.

Second, certain missionaries of a conservative theological bent, who affirmed the integrity of the biblical miracles, had little faith in their prolongation after the period of the early church, even though they believed that God answered prayer and acted sovereignly in human affairs. Falling short of a full-scale cessationism, they dismissed the relevance of miracles for evangelism and missions. Typical of this perspective, Mrs. H. Grattan (Fanny) Guinness, editor of the prominent evangelical missions magazine The Regions Beyond (Regions Beyond Missionary Union), asked, “What use would supernatural powers, such as were committed to the twelve and to the seventy, be to the modem missionary among the heathen? Miracles cannot enlighten their dark minds, or soften their hard hearts.” Speaking for the majority of missionaries, she added, “Our aim is to enlighten, not to astonish.”55

Third, as a result of witnessing for themselves or learning about unusual incidents on the mission fields, other evangelicals compared the first-time proclamation of the Gospel in non-Christian countries to the experience of the first-century church. Acknowledging the veracity of such events, Johannes Warneck (the son of Gustav Warneck) saw no further need for miracles after the successful introduction of Christianity on a foreign field. A missionary to the Dutch East Indies (now Indonesia) with the Rhenish Mission, he recorded that from the 1860s the Christian community increased after the coming of sensational phenomena, including dreams, visions, signs in the heavens, and several instances where missionaries (e.g., Ludwig Nommensen) unwittingly consumed poison in their food given by their enemies and remained unharmed (see Mark 16:18).56 But, Warneck contended, such miraculous events “have nothing more than a preparatory significance” and “lead no further than to the door of the Gospel.” Convinced they had “fulfilled their purpose of pointing the stupefied heathen to the gift of the Gospel,” he saw “the power of working signs and wonders” as simply temporary, just as they had been in early Christianity. Nonetheless, “We must not banish such experiences to the realm of fable. They are too well attested; and they are met with everywhere among animistic peoples with considerable regularity.”57

Fourth, evangelicals of a more radical persuasion allowed for the continuation of miracles and extraordinary spiritual manifestations, but within limits.58 Theodore Christlieb, a German theologian and premillennialist, maintained in Modern Doubt and Christian Belief (1874) that “in the last epoch of the consummation of the Church… she will again require for her final decisive struggle with the powers of darkness, the miraculous interference of her risen Lord, and hence the Scriptures lead us to expect miracles once more for this period.”59 As evidence of this position, he cites stories including one from the life of Hans Egede, the first evangelical (Lutheran) missionary to Greenland, who arrived there in 1721. Before mastering the languages of the natives, he gave a pictorial presentation of the miracles of Christ. “His hearers, who, like many in the time of Christ, had a perception only for bodily relief, [urged] him to prove the power of this Redeemer of the world upon their sick people.” Egede took the challenge and, with many “signs and prayers,” laid hands on the sick, after which several testified to being healed. “The Lord could not reveal Himself plainly enough to this mentally blunted and degraded race by merely spiritual means,” Christlieb adds, “and therefore bodily signs were needed.”60

No one publicized the occurrences of miracles in missions more than Arthur T. Pierson, editor of the influential Missionary Review of the World, who between 1891 and 1902 wrote a series of four books entitled The Miracles of Missions: Modern Marvels in the History of Missionary Enterprise. In volume 1 Pierson pays warm tribute to Christlieb, whose insights inspired the title of his books.61 Still, he and others in this category did not share what seemed to be the reckless expectancy of those who form the fifth category below. Pierson was content to discover a broad range of divine intervention in human affairs: unusual circumstances leading to conversions; amazing answers to prayer as in the case of financial needs; deliverances from danger; opened doors for ministry; the “miracles” of medical missions, advancing technology, and transportation; and sometimes even physical healings.62 For example, Pierson relates the healing of a Chinese epileptic after prayer by C. T. Studd, Stanley Smith, and other members of the famous Cambridge Seven,63 and he tells of his own healing from an ear problem.64

The story of W. J. Davis, the Methodist “missionary Elijah,” further illustrates this outlook. In a Bantu-speaking part of South Africa during the late 1840s, a severe drought caused the soil to dry up, and cattle began to die. Fears of famine led the tribal chief to employ the services of professional rainmakers. When they were unsuccessful, they blamed their failure on the presence of missionaries. Realizing the danger to his family, Davis knew that he had to act quickly. Riding on his horse into the chief’s village and interrupting ceremonies in progress, he announced that the rainmakers and the sins of the people were the real culprits. Emulating the prophet Elijah in challenging the prophets of Baal to a test on Mount Carmel (1 Kings 18:17–46), he proposed to his startled hearers, “Come to chapel next Sabbath, and we will pray to God, who made the heavens and the earth, to give us rain, and we will see who is the true God, and who are His true servants, and your best friends.” After the chief accepted his offer, Davis and his fellow believers spent the next day in fasting and prayer. On Sunday, and without a cloud in the sky, the chief and his retinue entered the church. Then as Davis and the congregation knelt in prayer, “big rain drops begin to patter on the zinc roof of the chapel… The whole region was so saturated with water that...
Faith in Development

Partnership between the World Bank and the Churches of Africa

Edited by
Deryke Belshaw, Robert Calderisi, Chris Sugden

Foreword by
James D. Wolfensohn, President of the World Bank, and George Carey, Archbishop of Canterbury

Faith in Development provides a fascinating glimpse of the emerging partnership between the World Bank and Faith-Based organizations to attack the root causes of poverty.

ISBN 1-870345-21-5  $24.95

WORLD BANK

REGNUM BOOKS INTERNATIONAL

Regnum Books International
P.O. Box 1047
129 Mobilization Drive
Waynesboro, GA 30830-2047
ph. 706.554.5827
www.regnumbooks.com
the river nearby became so swollen that the chief and his mother could not cross it that night, and hence had to remain at the mission-station till the next day.\(^{65}\)

Even though William Taylor, the pioneer Methodist missionary bishop in Africa, recorded the episode in his *Christian Adventures in South Africa* (1880), he doubted its enduring value. While it "seemed to produce a great impression on the minds of the chief, his mother, and the heathen party in favor of God and His missionaries, . . . signs, wonders, and even miracles, will not change the hearts of sinners." Taylor's opinion stemmed from his admitted disappointment that the chief's family did not convert.\(^{66}\) Although conceding that the Africans now considered the missionary to be a rainmaker, he failed to understand the implications of Davis's transformed status as a shaman or how the tribe's perspective on Christianity may have changed.

Interestingly, during the twentieth century a considerable number of missionaries found within the foregoing categories aligned themselves with autonomous "faith missions," whose personnel often lived abroad without advertising their financial needs. Some went alone as independent missionaries, but all prayed for the Lord's provision to come through the financial support of friends and backers at home. Critics decried the faith mission as the "Vagabond Mission."\(^{67}\) This novel and hotly debated strategy, with its own unique claim on the miraculous benefaction of God, can be traced back at least to Edward Irving (*Missionaries After the Apostolic School* [1825]) and Anthony Norris Groves (*Christian Devotedness* [1825]) early in the nineteenth century.

Turning the cessationist hourglass upside down, the radical evangelicals, who form the fifth category, anticipated the full restoration of miracles and spiritual gifts. Going one step further than those in the fourth category, these leaders on the fringe of the missions movement embraced unusual positions for their time. They believed that missionaries should pray for the sick and trust God for their own healing, which would serve as a witness of his power before the heathen. This notion was premised on the belief that healing is immediately available to every believer by the exercise of faith in the atoning work of Jesus Christ (Isa. 53:4-5; Matt. 8:17).\(^{68}\) In addition, they believed in intercessory prayer for spiritual victory in the cosmic realm to bind the power of satanic forces that resist the successful evangelization of the nations.\(^{69}\) Others suggested that God might bestow the "gift of tongues" on missionaries so they could preach immediately upon reaching their destinations, a major concern to premillennialists whose "zero-hour" eschatology left little time to evangelize.\(^{70}\)

Together they evoked a virtually apocalyptic scenario of God's direct intervention in "signs and wonders" (Acts 5:12) to ensure that every tribe and nation would hear the Gospel before the coming of Christ. The expected "last days" outpouring of the Holy Spirit, perceived by many as the only hope for enabling Christians to reach the world with the Gospel, led them to seek for the return of key elements of New Testament evangelism for their overall stratagem: an approach to mission centered largely on the action of the Holy Spirit invading Satan's realm with great demonstrations of power to gather out souls for Christ during the end-times harvest.\(^{71}\)

Supporters of God's direct involvement in mission through providential and miraculous events included A. B. Simpson, founder of the Alliance and the Missionary Training Institute in Nyack, New York, and A. J. Gordon, chair of the American Baptist Missionary Union and founder of the Boston Missionary Training School.\(^{72}\) After reflecting on the sad state of Protestant Christianity, Simpson expressed his discontent with the pedes­trian and seemingly ineffective mission practices of the day. He lamented that mainline Protestantism "has lost her faith . . . in the supernatural signs and workings of the Holy Ghost, she has lost the signs also, and the result is that she is compelled to produce conviction upon the minds of the heathen very largely by purely rational and moral considerations and influences."\(^{73}\) Now at the close of history, wrote Simpson, the return of the extraordinary gifts of the Holy Spirit would expedite the evangelization of the world.\(^{74}\)

Other controversial proponents included Benjamin Hardin Irwin, leader of the "fire-baptized" wing of the Holiness movement; the colorful John Alexander Dowie, the faith healer who established the utopian community of Zion City, Illinois; Frank W. Sandford, founder of the Holy Ghost and Us Bible School at Shiloh, Maine; Levi R. Lupton, a Friends evangelist, director of the Missionary Home and Training School and the World Evangelization Company in Alliance, Ohio; Elizabeth V. Baker, leader of the Elim Faith Home and the Rochester (N.Y.) Bible Training School; and Charles F. Parham, a Holiness evangelist who started Bethel Bible School in Topeka, Kansas. These and others envisioned sending out end-times missionaries filled with the Holy Spirit in whose ministries unusual displays of God's power would be the norm rather than the exception.

**Conclusion**

Schaff's claim that no transition in the history of Christianity was so "sudden, abrupt, and radical as that from the apostolic to the post-apostolic age" reflects the dramatic shift away from the miraculous that was encouraged by the Reformers, post-Reformation scholastic theologians, and philosophers of the Enlight­enment. Because of the impact on historiography and the ethnocentricity of historians and missiologists, accounts of paranor­mal happenings have been largely excluded in the composition of textbook histories and related mission studies.

Despite the reservations of Western academics, paranormal phenomena have indeed played a vital role in the growth of Christianity, although whether in every local context and to what extent must still be determined. Far from being peripheral, they explain much about the acceptance of the faith by native peoples whose non-Western patterns of reasoning paralleled that of the audiences to whom the apostles and Gregory Thaumaturgus preached. Fortunately, scholars now exhibit more interest in learning about the worldviews of indigenous Christians.\(^{75}\) This development has important ramifications for the writing of Christian history in the twenty-first century, for historians and missiologists now have an unparalleled opportunity to show the interchange between often overlooked but visible spiritual dy­namics and religious and cultural changes.\(^{76}\) Though such phe-
nomena represent just one factor in the shaping of Christianity, their importance should not be underestimated as the “decolonization” of history proceeds.

American Baptist missionary Francis Mason, who recorded the early years of missions in Myanmar for a Western audience, perceptively noted that “the introduction of Christianity among the Karens is, perhaps, too full of ‘truth stranger than fiction’ to be believed by those who have not been actors in the scenes themselves.” Incredible though it all may have seemed to him, Mason preserved the story to enable his readers to grasp the full scope of how the Karens became Christians. For this reason, we are in his debt.

From another perspective, had Alexander Duff been aware of how the Karens accepted the faith after Jonathan and Deborah Wade entered their village, it might have broadened his understanding of the worldview of his Indian students. He would have discovered dynamics beyond verbal proclamation and Western learning that could have potentially influenced their reception of the Gospel. Indigenous peoples like the Karens, Indians, Jamaicans, Bataks, and Bantus knew much better than their missionary mentors the relevance of Paul’s description of the founding of the church at Thessalonica for their own contexts: “Our message of the gospel came to you not in word only, but also in power and in the Holy Spirit, and with full conviction” (1 Thess. 1:5).

Notes

4. For the purposes of this article, the definition of paranormal phenomena or “supernatural” demonstrations embraces (1) claims of miracles, that is, events perceived as divine interventions into the realm of humanity and nature; (2) unusual incidents viewed by those in attendance as divine that have no biblical precedents but have some connection to main events in Scripture; and (3) manifestations of the “charismata” such as the gifts of prophecy, tongues, healings, and discerning of spirits (1 Cor. 12:7–11). See Robert Bruce Mullin, Miracles and the Modern Religious Imagination (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1996), p. 6.
8. Warfield, Counterfeit Miracles, p. 64.
15. For Patrick’s own account, see Joseph Duffy, Patrick: In His Own Words (Dublin: Veritas Publications, 1972), pp. 12–38.
23. For example, J. Edwin Orr, Evangelical Awakenings in Southern Asia (Minneapolis: Bethany Fellowship, 1975).
33. It can be no less problematic in other historical accounts, such as agency histories and autobiographies.
38. Mary K. Crawford, *The Shantung Revival* (Alexandria, La.: Lamplighter Publications, 1933); p. 27. The unusual happenings in Shandong still remain outside the range of accepted Southern Baptist historiography and missiology.
42. Ibid., pp. 34-36, 368-70.
47. Ibid., p. 149.
49. Ibid., pp. 105–6.
52. Shenk, “Toward a Global Church History,” p. 56.
60. Ibid.
66. Ibid., pp. 276–77. As it happened, neither Davis’s name nor this astonishing incident appears in Wade Crawford Barclay’s detailed multivolume *History of Methodist Missions* (New York: United Methodist Church, 1949–57), published over a century later.
69. For example, Alfred E. Street, *Intercessory Foreign Missionaries: Practical Suggestions from a Missionary to Earnest Christians* (Boston: American Advent Mission Society [ca. 1903–ca. 1923]), pp. 5–11. The tract was also published by the Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions and later by Moody Press. A more radical approach came with Frank W. Sandford; see his *Seven Years with God* (Mont Vernon, N.H.: Kingdom Press, 1957), pp. 142–45.
72. Note Warfield’s fierce polemic against Gordon’s views on faith healing in *Counterfeit Miracles*, pp. 160–64.
75. For example, Julie C. Ma, *When the Spirit Meets the Spirits: Pentecostal Ministry Among the Kankanay-ey Tribe in the Philippines* (Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2000).
Women Missionaries in India: Opening Up the Restrictive Policies of Rufus Anderson

Eugene Heideman

In 1870 two single young American women, Martha Mandeville and Josephine Chapin, arrived in Vellore, South India, to serve as “assistant missionaries” in the Arcot Mission of the Reformed Church in America (RCA). Although the mission would have preferred receiving ordained men, the male missionaries welcomed them in the anticipation that the young women would be valuable as visitors among Indian women and as assistants in the female seminary where Christian young women were being educated to become wives of Indian catechists and teachers. But for some reason, Mandeville and Chapin were permitted to go beyond this expectation. They were allowed to open two schools in Vellore for Hindu girls.

The schools—which were an immediate success—conflicted with the policy of the Arcot Mission from the time of its founding in 1853. According to that policy, the mission was resolved not to become involved in “civilizing” Hindus in educational institutions. Evangelism and church planting were to be the only priorities for the work of the missionaries.

This policy reflected the views of the most influential mission administrator of the era, Rufus Anderson. Anderson served as senior secretary of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM). For much of the mid-nineteenth century RCA missionaries were sent out under the auspices of the ABCFM, and thus they came under the influence of Anderson’s mission principles. It would be another thirty years before freedom in ministry by missionary women, such as was exercised by Mandeville and Chapin, received full endorsement.

Anderson directed the ABCFM from 1832 to 1866. Mission historian R. Pierce Beaver has written, “There has never been another person in the American world mission who has rivaled Anderson in creativity, in shaping policy, and in uniting the roles of administrator and theoretician.” Anderson, in what is commonly known as the three-self theory, stated that the aim of missions is to plant and foster churches that will be self-governing, self-supporting, and self-propagating. His view remains influential to this day. He included four factors in this aim of missions: “(1) the conversion of lost men, (2) organizing them into churches, (3) giving these churches a competent ministry, and (4) conducting them to the stage of independence and (in most cases) of self-propagation. Anything additional is secondary, or even superfluous.”

A corollary contention of Anderson was that missionaries are sent to evangelize, not to civilize. They are sent to be evangelists, not pastors or rulers. Their business is not with believers, but with unbelievers. Civilizing, or social transformation, is not a legitimate aim; it will follow as a natural consequence of the impact of the Gospel.” Preaching the Word and planting churches is the very heart of the missionary task. A second corollary contention was that women have a subordinate role as missionaries because they are not directly engaged in evangelism and planting churches but instead are engaged in the supporting activities, such as education, that are more properly understood as civilizing roles.

Rufus Anderson viewed the role of women in mission as limited to modeling the Christian family.

The interaction between these two contentions can be observed as they were implemented, first, in the ABCFM Jaffna Mission in Ceylon in the years leading up to 1855 and, second, in the Reformed Church of America Arcot Mission from 1853 until the end of the century.

Anderson and Women’s Role in Mission

Dana L. Robert in American Women in Mission contends that in setting evangelizing against civilizing, and subordinating education to direct evangelism, Anderson also kept women in a subordinate role in the task of mission. This is not to say that he failed to recognize the importance of women on the mission field. He was a firm supporter of the role of the missionary wife, preferring not to send out men unless they were married. He wrote, “The heathen should have an opportunity of seeing Christian families. The domestic constitution among [the heathen] is dreadfully disordered, and yet it is as true there as everywhere else, that the character of society is formed in the family. To rectify it requires example as well as precept.”

Anderson found an ally in Mary Lyon, who in 1837 had opened Mount Holyoke Female Seminary in South Hadley, Massachusetts. Together they agreed that it was important for potential female missionaries to have a more advanced level of training in academic disciplines in addition to their personal faith and their experience in Christian service and benevolence. At Mount Holyoke, self-sacrifice and careful management of time and money were the twin pillars of female mission theory. Students had to do their own housework in order that they would understand that self-discipline and sacrifice would train them for life in the world. While Anderson and Lyon agreed that Mount Holyoke graduates should gain dignity and self-confidence along with a good education, the subordinate role of women in society was not directly challenged. Lyon warned her pupils that “ladies never can be independent; and those best educated must feel their dependence.”

Robert shows that Anderson believed it was crucial to establish “female seminaries” in mission areas in order that native pastors, catechists, and teachers would have Christian wives to work alongside them. The female seminary “is not only the most direct way, but is the only way we could devise, to provide wives, with the blessing of God, for the native evangelists and teachers, and other helpers in the revival of pure religion.” Missionary wives who had been educated according to the Mount Holyoke Female Seminary model were expected to play a crucial role as
teachers and models for future wives of Indian pastors and catechists.

Role of ABCFM Women in India and Ceylon

By 1850 Anderson increasingly was evaluating all mission work, including the contribution of women, in terms of effectiveness in establishing churches. Thereby he minimized social development as a legitimate focus for mission. He was disappointed that the number of mission schools in Ceylon and India was producing only a small number of converts. In 1854–55 he and Augustus Thompson went to India and Ceylon with the intention of streamlining the educational system and making it directly subservient to evangelism. The number of schools was to be reduced, and their sole purpose would be to train indigenous preachers and teachers. All instruction was to be in the vernacular language and not in English. (At that time, English language instruction was desirable as preparation for gaining employment in colonial business and governmental bodies.)

Anderson and Thompson met with the mission administrators in Ceylon to discuss the future of the very successful Oodooville Female Boarding School, which was the only mission institution supervised by female missionaries. By 1849 the school had overcome the reluctance of the local people to send their daughters to school. The missionaries had seen its graduates become models for Tamil Christian families. Fully 120 Oodooville girls had been married to Christian husbands. Many of its graduates had become teachers. The missionaries told Anderson and Thompson, "There is no part of our missionary work which we have regarded with more pleasure and hope than this school, and there are no results of our labor here which seem to us to be telling, with more power, at the present moment, upon the evangelization of the land, than those connected with this department of our mission."9

In spite of the school’s excellent record, the women in charge of the school were not allowed to speak or vote. The ABCFM deputation insisted that the purpose of the school be narrowed to the sole goal of educating wives for native pastors and catechists, without regard to the need of other Christian men for wives. No non-Christians would be allowed to attend. The number of girls enrolled was to be reduced from seventy-three to thirty-five, which was the anticipated number of wives needed for pastors and catechists. The policy set by Anderson and Thompson for Oodooville also was implemented in India. Robert concludes, "The end result of making education subservient to evangelism was to frustrate the major way that female missionaries were able to minister in the Indian context."10

One of the ABCFM missionaries in Ceylon who was in full agreement with Rufus Anderson’s three-self theory and the two corollaries noted above was Dr. John Scudder. On June 8, 1819, Scudder, newly appointed missionary under the ABCFM, with his wife, Harriet Waterbury (designated as an "assistant missionary"), boarded the brig Indus, with Ceylon as their ultimate destination. They were the first missionary couple to be supported by the Reformed Church in America (RCA),11 which at that time did not have its own missionary board. Scudder was an experienced physician but was not yet an ordained minister. Scudder was ordained in September 1821 in a Wesleyan chapel in Ceylon with Methodist, Congregational, and Baptist ministers performing the ordination.12 The Scudders served in the ABCFM Jaffna Mission in Ceylon until 1836, when they moved to India to serve in the Madras Mission.

Scudder was in full agreement with Anderson that the Western missionary must be an evangelizer rather than a civilizer. Although he was the first American to be sent overseas as a medical missionary, he was convinced that medicine was but a means to an end; the body was to be healed so that the soul might be saved.13 He was also in agreement with Anderson’s understanding of the role of female missionaries as being crucial but subservient to the role of men.

Harriet Scudder proved an ideal self-sacrificing missionary wife in creating a Christian home as a model for new believers. After her infant daughter died on the way to Ceylon and the next two babies born to her in Ceylon also died, she went on without complaining. In subsequent years their ten additional children grew up under her care. All of them except Samuel, who drowned while in theological seminary, would give missionary service in India. Typical of her service is the report that her husband wrote in December, 1821, when she was in the seventh month of her fourth pregnancy. Harriet was helping educate the children in the mission school and “taking care of almost the whole of [our] domestic concerns, which are neither few nor small. She has ten females under her care. These she teaches to sew in the afternoon. In the morning she begins to hear the boys recite in English, which is no small labor. . . . She sometimes visits the people.”14

Women’s Role in the American Arcot Mission

John Scudder and his three oldest sons became the founders of the RCA American Arcot Mission in India in 1853. Since no other mission in its beginning decades was so determined to be faithful to the principles of Anderson, it is instructive to follow developments in that mission between 1853 and 1900. Although a board of foreign missions had been established in 1832 by the RCA, the church continued to operate overseas through the ABCFM. By 1850 many within the denomination believed that there would be much stronger financial support for foreign missions if the RCA were responsible for its own mission in India. Three sons of John and Harriet Scudder by that time had completed their theological education in America and as ordained ministers were prepared with their wives to serve as missionaries in India.15

With the permission of Anderson the three Scudder brothers, Henry Martyn, William Waterbury, and Joseph, became the first members of the new American Arcot Mission (AAM) directly responsible to the Reformed Church in America rather than to the ABCFM. (Within a few years they would be joined by their other brothers, Ezekiel Carman, John, Jr., Jared Waterbury, and Silas.) Their wives were enrolled as “assistant members.” The new mission was to be located in the North and South Arcot Districts centered about 90 miles west of Madras, comprising an area roughly the size of the state of New Jersey. Its founding principles stated that the threefold work of the mission was restricted to (1) the preaching of the Gospel without being encumbered with institutions that would hinder that work, (2) the preparation and extensive diffusion of vernacular tracts and
Operation World
Patrick Johnstone
The updated version of this remarkable prayer encyclopedia tells what God has been doing in numerous countries. Factual and very detailed, Operation World is also inspiring in its coverage of the powerful reality of God's Spirit at work around the world.

STL357-8 Paternoster, paperback
Retail $17.99 Discount $10.00
*Wholesale $8.50

World Christian Trends, AD 30-AD 2200
David Barrett & Todd Johnson
This valuable resource is a global overview of world Christianity that analyzes, interprets and evaluates the country-by-country data reported in the 2001 World Christian Encyclopedia. Special features include the first ever statistical survey of evangelism/ization; statistical survey of persecution and Christian martyrs; projections to AD 2200 about Christianity and world religions.

WCL608-0 William Carey Library, hardcover, 880 pp.

Churchless Christianity (revised edition)
Herbert Hoofer
The purpose of this book is to describe a fact and reflect upon it theologically. The fact is that there are thousands of people in India who believe solely in Jesus Christ as their Lord and Saviour but who have no plans to take baptism or join the church. Churchless Christianity is based on research from the early 1980s among non-baptised believers in Christ in Tamilnadu, India. This revised edition includes all the original text plus five additional chapters and a new foreword.

WCL444-4 William Carey Library, paperback

Operation China
Paul Hattaway
Operation China introduces the minority peoples of China, made up of 490 groups and more than 100 million members. These diverse cultures, from the blue-eyed Muslims of Xinjiang to the tribal peoples of the jungles of Yunnan, are presented using brilliantly colored photographs, anthropological and geographical data, maps, statistics and a prayer calendar. Indexed with an extensive bibliography of publications.

Retail $35.95 Discount $28.76
*Wholesale $21.57

World Christian Encyclopedia
Barrett, Kurian and Johnson
Two huge volumes with 1699 pages, this second edition is full of the latest global level information. Volume #1 The World By Countries: Religionists, Churches, Ministries. Volume #2 The World By Segments: Religions, Peoples, Languages, Cities, Topics.

Retail $299.00 Discount $234.00
*Wholesale $224.00

Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions
A. Scott Moreau
Over 1,400 articles on the practice, history, theology and theory of world missions make up this comprehensive resource. More than three hundred missionaries, theologians and educators from a variety of cultural, denominational and ethnic backgrounds contributed. BONUS: We'll include extra indexes developed to help readers and instructors use the book.

Retail $66.00 Discount $33.00
*Wholesale $29.75

*NOTE: Buy three or more copies of the same title to get the wholesale price. MasterCard, Visa, American Express and Discover are accepted. All checks must be in U.S. funds and drawn from a U.S. bank. Prices subject to change without notice. See our complete list at WWW.WCLBOOKS.COM

William Carey Library
Publishers and Distributors
1-800-MISSION
Outside the US: 706-554-1594 Fax: 706-554-7444
GABRIEL@OMLIT.OM.ORG WCLBOOKS.COM
Please mention "IBM" when placing your order.
books specially adapted to the Hindu mind and character, and (3) the education of those who became Christians. There were to be no schools for Hindu children. Village schools were to be offered for children of Christians, in buildings erected to serve a school and church “where parents and children attend on the Sabbath and learn the way of the Gospel.”

The first report of the mission, issued in 1854, gives evidence of how sincere the first missionaries were in giving priority to evangelism, preaching, and Scripture distribution over establishing educational and medical institutions. The report indicates that Henry Martyn Scudder had opened a small dispensary when he moved to the town of Wallajangar early in 1853. By the end of 1853 it was closed because Henry Martyn had become ill, and “God in His Providence has taken away our Dispensary and thrown us more entirely upon the preaching of His Word—divested even of this auxiliary—so that the fundamental principle of our mission may shine out in its simple oneness.” The monies remaining in the medical account were transferred to the tract and book fund.

While the male members of the mission were devoting themselves to evangelistic touring, preaching the Gospel, distributing tracts and Scriptures, and planting churches, their wives were busy in their supporting role as exemplary mothers in Christian families. They also undertook to make it possible for young men being trained as pastors, catechists, and teachers to have literate Christian wives. Already in 1855 Sarah (Mrs. Ezekiel) Scudder had taken three orphan girls as boarders in her home and instructed them daily, along with three other girls. Her efforts led in 1860 to the establishment of the Female Seminary, with a clear purpose for its existence: “The object of this school is to train up a class of girls who will be fitted to become the wives of our native helpers. While we strive to give them a good plain education, we do not neglect those things which the wife of a native should know. They learn to cook, to sew, and to do all kinds of housework. We do not wish to raise them above, but to fit them for the position they will be called to fill.”

The Female Seminary fulfilled its purpose well. The mission reported annually on the number of girls who had become wives of “native helpers”: one in 1861, one in 1862, three in 1863. By 1889, Jared W. Scudder was able to report: “Last I married ten couples in the Vellore church. The bridegrooms [included] six from the Arcot Seminary and the brides [were] from the Female Seminary. A gallant sight it was to see the twenty—all dressed in their graceful and brilliant Oriental costume standing in a circle around the pulpit with a packed audience in the background.”

Testing the Evangelizing/Civilizing Distinction

The first Arcot missionary to raise questions about the strict interpretation of the mission’s founding principles was Joseph Mayou, who with his wife, Margaret, had arrived in India in 1858. After completing their Tamil language studies, the Mayous were assigned to serve in the mission station in Arni. They proved to be effective and zealous evangelistic missionaries. Soon there were group movements in a number of the surrounding rural villages. Joseph Mayou followed the mission’s policy that wherever there were three Christian families in a village, the mission would assign a catechist/teacher to the village for the education of the Christian children and pastoral care of the new Christians. He soon felt overwhelmed with the heavy burdens of their care and quickly foresaw that it would be difficult for the RCA to provide adequate financial assistance to provide church buildings and employed leaders for all the villages.

He began to raise a number of questions about the radical distinction between evangelizing and civilizing. He questioned the fundamental mission policy that new converts had to break caste by eating and drinking together at Holy Communion and by eating a common meal together when they were baptized. He also objected to the requirement that Hindu converts immediately cut off the kudumi topknot of hair and sacred cord as marks of caste. Since higher caste Hindus did not wish to be cut off from their families, one of the consequences of this requirement was that only very-low-caste persons were entering the church. He pointed out that Americans did not impose this kind of requirement for Christian maturity on those who were not ready to accept “blacks” in their congregations.

Mayou touched another nerve when he called into question the fundamental policy of the mission to open only vernacular schools that were for the children of Christians alone. In his first years at Arni he had broken the rule by opening a small school for Hindu children at his mission station and also desired to provide some instruction in English. He believed that if the church was to become truly self-governing and self-supporting, it had to be more open and attractive to the higher castes and provide a course of education more likely to raise the economic level in the church.

Although Mayou in theory accepted the American Arcot Mission’s clear distinction between evangelizing and civilizing, his missionary colleagues recognized that he was beginning to blur the line between the two. Personal relationships with the other missionaries became acrimonious, and charges of heresy were made against Mayou, who was suspected of being too favorably disposed toward the Christian-nurture emphasis in the theology of Horace Bushnell. By the middle of 1869 Mayou’s position as a missionary in India became untenable, and the family returned to America. At the end of 1869, the mission still refused to open schools to Hindu students and to include English as a subject or medium of instruction.

In the year after the Mayous left India, a more subtle attack on policies inherited from Anderson arose as the two young unmarried women, Martha Mandeville and Josephine Chapin, appeared on the scene. Anderson had discouraged appointing unmarried women to serve overseas. The men of the American Arcot Mission agreed that emphasis should be placed on the appointment of married couples, rather than unmarried men or women. No unmarried man was appointed until 1881. In the case of an unmarried woman, they followed the policy advocated by Anderson that any unmarried woman should be required to live in a home with one of the missionary married couples. Prior to the arrival of Mandeville and Chapin, there had been only two unmarried women in the mission, both of whom were daughters of John and Harriet Scudder. Their daughter Harriet served from 1854 to 1856, and the second, Louise, from 1855 to 1861. Both lived with a brother’s family during their time of service.

It is not clear that the male missionaries were altogether happy with the presence of Mandeville and Chapin. The official
mission minutes for 1870 state that the women were welcomed, but in 1928 Ethel Scudder (wife of John Scudder’s grandson Lewis R.) remembered that they were “received rather coldly at first.”22 In any case, the two young women were soon breaking new ground for the Arcot Mission. Contrary to the original policy of the mission that educational efforts would be confined to vernacular schools for children of Christians and others being instructed in the faith, the two women were given permission to open a Hindu Caste Girls’ School in Vellore for girls of families who were not Christian. Their efforts met with such immediate and unusual success that two additional schools were opened.23 On the basis of the Vellore experience, within the next thirteen years five additional Hindu girls’ schools were opened in the Arcot area.

The men of the Arcot Mission, faced with the success of the first school, did not stop the two unmarried assistant missionaries from continuing their efforts, although only cursory mention is made of the Hindu girls’ schools in the annual mission reports. In 1874 Josephine Chapin was forced to return to America for health reasons. The relatively low priority the men gave to the school is shown by the fact that in the same year Martha Mandeville was transferred to Chittoor to teach in the Female Academy. With Mandeville transferred out of the area, one of the missionary wives, Sarah Scudder, in Vellore was given responsibility for the Hindu girls’ schools, even though it was anticipated that “her already numerous duties will render it impossible for her to give them the care and attention they need.”25

Nevertheless, assignment of the wife of a missionary to be in charge of the schools apparently worked to encourage her husband and then others to take more interest in and give more support to the Hindu girls’ schools. By 1878 education of women had become important alongside preaching as a means to the evangelization of India. The purpose of Hindu girls’ schools was clearly stated by Josephine Chapin: “The aim of these schools is to carry the word of God to the daughters and families of the better classes of Hindus, whose caste, a social and religious distinction, makes them almost inaccessible to missionary effort. While we instruct them in secular studies and in needlework, the one object for which the schools were founded, is made paramount to every other. All the children who are old enough to read are studying the Bible daily and learning the way of salvation through Christ.”26

Civilizing as Legitimate Aspect of Mission

The door opened by the Hindu girls’ schools led to the further blurring of the boundary between evangelizing and civilizing when John H. Wyckoff, a respected missionary, accepted responsibility for an Anglo-vernacular boys’ school in Tindivanam in 1878. He recognized the need for a change in policy when he commented: “Boys of all classes, Christians, Brahmins, Sudras, Pariahs and Mohammedans, read together with no distinction of caste, and the effect this has brought about in removing caste differences is very marked. Much interest has been taken in the Scripture lesson…. I am firmly convinced of the usefulness of such a school at a Missionary station. Nothing serves so well as a stepping-stone to work among the higher classes as a school which admits all castes.”27

Although the male members of the mission had accepted the legitimacy of civilizing work in the schools, the lower priority that they gave to those schools, especially the girls’ schools, became clear in 1896, when the RCA mission board experienced a severe financial deficit and required the Arcot Mission to reduce its budget by 14 percent after there had already been budget reductions in the three previous years. The men reluctantly made across-the-board reductions for a number of areas, including education. But then they made a drastic decision that betrayed their continuing hesitation about women’s education in general and the Hindu girls’ school in particular. They informed the women supervisors that all the Hindu girls’ schools must be closed for financial reasons.

The women were furious. Four missionary wives wrote letters to be published in the Woman’s Board of Foreign Missions’ monthly magazine, The Gleaner, appealing for support for the schools. The Woman’s Board secretary protested that the Board of Foreign Missions and the Arcot Mission were shortsighted and also had no right to use contributions designated for support of the Hindu girls’ schools for other purposes, not even for evangelism.28

The men backed down. They found other ways to make budget cuts. The Hindu girls’ schools remained open. The concern of the RCA women for the educational and social uplift of women in India had been confirmed as a legitimate goal of mission.

The denomination’s Woman’s Board for Foreign Missions was established in 1875 with a stated purpose that included civilizing as well as evangelizing.29 Article 2 of its constitution read, “Its object shall be to aid the Board of Foreign Missions of the Reformed Church in America, by promoting its work among the women and children of heathen lands.”30 The Woman’s Board recognized its subordinate relationship to the exclusively male Board of Foreign Missions, even to the extent that in its first years a man always presided at its meetings. All of the prayers and reports were presented by men, even when a report had been written by a woman.31

The Woman’s Board was particularly concerned to support missionary women and Indian Bible women who visited Indian wives in the zenanas. The men accepted such visitation as legitimate because it was not possible for male preachers to gain access to those women. Mary Anna (Mrs. Silas) Scudder and Margaret Mayou and other wives of missionaries had already engaged in such work in the 1860s. Zenana work among Hindu women had gained further acceptance after the establishment of the Hindu girls’ schools. Many of the girls in those schools were removed by their parents from the schools soon after puberty for the purpose of marriage. But confined to the zenana following marriage, those girls longed to continue their study of arithmetic, reading, sewing, hygiene, and domestic economy, as well as to learn more about the Bible and the Christian faith. By 1888 eighteen Bible women were employed by the mission to visit in homes and other places. Miss M. K. Scudder in 1884 had been appointed as an unmarried assistant missionary to work with the wives of missionaries in supervising the Bible women and zenana program for the uplift of Indian women.32 The clear distinction between evangelizing and civilizing activity could not be maintained in the zenanas.
With the success of the zenana program, the way was open to the appointment during the 1890s of more unmarried women for evangelizing and civilizing activity for the uplift of women. One of them, Miss Annie Hancock, who was appointed in 1899, gained an intimate knowledge of Indian women through her work in schools, visits with them in the zenanas, and through the Bible women under her supervision, who were visiting over 400 homes in Vellore. On the basis of her experience she opened a social service center in 1920 for Hindu and Christian women where they could escape the isolation of their homes. At the center they could sew, play, learn, and attend cultural programs, including special programs for Christmas and Easter.  

Just as the boundaries were becoming blurred between evangelizing and civilizing work in education and mission through the activities of female missionaries, so it was also true in the field of medical mission. By 1890 the Woman's Board for Foreign Missions was concerned that Indian women have better access to modern medical care, but between 1853 and 1890 medical care had a lower priority than evangelism in the activities of the mission. The mission had never asked the Board of Foreign Missions to send a physician except in the case of Silas Scudder.

Although a number of the first male missionaries were surgeons and physicians, all members of the Arcot Mission agreed that their medical practice was subordinate to their evangelistic duty to preach the Gospel. Dr. Silas Scudder, the only brother who was not an ordained minister, was constantly disappointed that his colleagues refused to appropriate money for medical work. In 1863 Silas worked with a sense of having been abandoned by his fellow missionaries. "I have no money, no place in which to receive patients, no apothecary, and no medicines." As late as 1899 Rev. Dr. Lewis R. Scudder in Ranipet agreed that his evangelistic touring was more important than his work as superintendent of the hospital. His missionary colleagues also wanted the hospital to be entirely self-supporting and to divert the $2,000 appropriated by the Board of Foreign Missions for medical work to evangelism and village work.

Once again it was the initiative of the Woman's Board of Foreign Missions that opened the door to wider acceptance of the civilizing activity of medical uplift for women. In 1895 it appointed Dr. Louisa M. Hart to be a medical missionary in India and followed that action by appointing Dr. Ida S. Scudder in 1899. These two women of outstanding dedication and ability made an immediate impact in providing medical care for women in India, who were usually reluctant to be seen by male doctors.

Louisa Hart gained immense respect through her risky and dedicated service during the bubonic plague of 1899, when she went through the streets and homes of Vellore examining women in their houses and inoculating all who would accept the vaccine. In one week she inoculated 1,000 people. Shortly thereafter she began to advocate the opening of a woman's hospital to be located in Vellore, at a cost of $8,000 with an annual budget of $1,500. When she was transferred to the Telugu-speaking area, she discovered the need for a center to treat persons suffering from tuberculosis. She gained the support of male missionaries such as J. H. Wyckoff, who assisted her in gaining the cooperation of other missions and in opening the Union Mission Tuberculosis Sanatorium in 1910, which became the leading center for treatment of tuberculosis in India.

Dr. Hart’s vision for a woman’s hospital in Vellore was fulfilled when a donor in the United States in 1902 provided the funds in memory of Mary Tabor Schell. When Dr. Ida Scudder joined her in Vellore, Hart felt free to open medical work for women in other towns at some distance from Vellore. Ida Scudder’s energies soon went into pioneering training of female nurses and doctors in India. Ultimately, under the enthusiastic leadership of Dr. Scudder and the support of women around the world, the Mary Tabor Schell Hospital developed into the leading medical institution in India, the Christian Medical College and Hospital in Vellore.

The strength of Ida Scudder as she became a world-famous missionary was that she combined her concern for evangelism with her compassion and friendship for all who came to the hospital. The story has often been told of how she was motivated to become a missionary doctor for women in India at the age of eighteen when on one night three Hindu men came to her parents' home in Tindivanam, India, seeking medical help for their wives about to give birth. All three women died that night because a female doctor was not available. The compassion aroused in her that night became fully integrated with her understanding of the purpose of the woman’s hospital, when in 1906 she stated, “The great purpose for which the hospital was founded is the pointing of sin-sick souls to a loving Saviour who can save them from their sins, and for this end and purpose we work. Every patient is told of Christ’s love for them.”

In the early decades of the twentieth century, Arcot missionaries and Indian leaders affirmed that educational, medical, and socioeconomic institutional service could be justified as mission service in its own right rather than only as a support for evangelizing. It was maintained that medical mission should not be justified on the basis of its evangelistic intent but directly on its relation to the love of Jesus Christ for suffering humanity. The basic function was to show forth the love of God as revealed in Jesus Christ through the practice of medicine. Defenders of the other institutions were making similar statements about how their activities in education, economic development, and social service were important manifestations of the love of Jesus Christ.

From Mission to Church

At the beginning of the twentieth century, the work of the American Arcot Mission went through a process of devolution by which the self-governing, self-propagating, and to some extent self-supporting South India United Church became responsible for much of what the mission had previously done. Anderson’s separation of evangelizing from civilizing activity assumed that the mission and the missionary were separate from the church. He had assumed that when such devolution had taken place, the missionaries would leave and begin new work in “regions beyond.” In the Arcot area, neither the missionaries nor the Indian church leaders felt that the missionaries should leave. Instead, the church itself became responsible for carrying out the twin activities of evangelizing and nurturing the life of the people in the church and nation. Faithfulness in these dual responsibilities has been the challenge facing the church and the missionaries working within the church to the present day.

The full role of women was finally acknowledged. They were no longer "assistant missionaries."
STUDY WITH FACULTY AND STUDENTS FROM AROUND THE WORLD

FACULTY
on the cutting edge, each experienced in global mission

STUDENTS
national leaders on campus from more than 60 countries and over 100 denominations

CURRICULUM
strong core of theology of mission with 15 concentrations

COMMITMENT
strongly evangelical, committed to biblical authority

PROGRAMS
M.A., Th.M., D.Min., D.Miss., Ph.D., continuing education, combining resident and extension studies

Call our Office of Admissions
1-800-2FULLER www.fuller.edu
135 N. Oakland Ave. Pasadena, CA 91182

FULLER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY
SCHOOL OF WORLD MISSION
In the first decade of the twentieth century, the full role of women in mission was acknowledged. They were now “missionaries,” no longer “assistant missionaries.” They had full and equal rights of vote and participation in discussion in the proceedings of the mission. As the work of the mission devolved into the life and responsibility of the church, the South India United Church in 1908, and then especially the Church of South India in 1947, made special provisions for the full recognition of the high priority of work among women and for representation of women in the councils of the church. Nevertheless, in practice women, even at the beginning of the twenty-first century, often continue to discover that their gifts for ministry and service are not always fully accepted. The churches in America and India are still working to complete the process that began when two young women were sent to the American Arcot Mission in 1870.

Notes
2. Ibid.
3. Ibid., p. 550.
7. Ibid., p. 104.
9. Robert, American Women in Mission, p. 120.
10. Ibid., pp. 116–22.
11. The official name of the Reformed Church in America prior to 1867 was the Reformed Protestant Dutch Church.
14. Waterbury, Memoir, p. 79.
17. Ibid., pp. 8–9.
18. Ibid., p. 160, 11. Ezekiel Scudder was the fourth brother to join the AAM.
20. Mayou’s letters to the RCA corresponding secretary in New York, April 13, 1869, and to the secretary of the mission, May 13, 1869, present a clear statement of Mayou’s understanding of the nature of his differences with the other missionaries that had developed over the past decade. With regard to caste issues, Mayou was advocating what Donald A. McGavran would urge in 1961 with regard to new converts, that a distinction be made between the work of discipling and that of perfecting. (See McGavran’s Bridges of God: A Study in the Strategy of Missions [London: World Dominion Press, 1961], pp. 94–102)
21. All of the other RCA missionaries were strong defenders of the Anselmic doctrine of the atonement, while they understood Bushnell to lean in the direction of an Abelardian moral-influence doctrine. They feared that Bushnell’s emphasis on nurture rather than the requirement for conversion as taught by American evangelists would lead in India to a decrease in emphasis on evangelism. The full transcript of the heresy trial conducted by the Classis of Arcot in India does not necessarily leave one with the impression that Mayou was heretical, in spite of the decision of the classis. The transcript is available in the RCA archives in New Brunswick.
24. Two out of the three, however, went out of existence within a short time.
27. Board of Foreign Missions Report to the General Synod of the Reformed Church in America, 1873, p. 20.
30. Woman’s Board of Foreign Missions Report, 1875, p. 17. In 1861 Anderson had opposed the organization of an interdenominational national woman’s board.
31. Mary Chamberlain, Fifty Years in Foreign Fields (New York: Woman’s Board of Foreign Missions, 1925), pp. 5–7, 15–16.
32. Ibid., pp. 89–91.
34. AAM Report, 1863, p. 33.
35. J. H. Wyckoff to Henry Cobb, March 15, 1899, accompanied by remarks of others, RCA Archives.
36. Chamberlain, Fifty Years, p. 93.
37. For a full biography of Ida Scudder, see Dorothy Clarke Wilson, Dr. Ida: Passing on the Torch of Life (New York: Friendship Press, 1976).
38. AAM Report, 1906, p. 29.
40. For a full discussion of developments in the twentieth century, see Heideman, From Mission to Church, chaps. 6–12.

*
Gender, Mission, and Higher Education in Cross-Cultural Context: Isabella Thoburn in India

Maina Chawla Singh

The city of Lucknow, North India, bears the distinction of being home to one of the first women’s colleges in Asia, Isabella Thoburn College (ITC). Named after its founder, Isabella Thoburn (1840–1901), an American missionary, ITC began as a girls’ school with six pupils in 1870. From these modest beginnings it grew to become a collegiate institution in 1886 and by the beginning of the twentieth century, a prestigious women’s college in North India. It exists to this day, like many other missionary schools and colleges in South Asia that have outlived their founders and the British Raj.

Thoburn, the first woman missionary to be sponsored by the Woman’s Foreign Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, expressed her vision for India’s women in an article written in 1886: “The need of India today is leadership from among her own people, leadership not of impulsive enthusiasm or prejudice but of matured judgement and conscientious conviction. Part of our work as missionaries is to educate and train the character that can lead and it is to accomplish this that we formed our first woman’s college in the East world.”

The early history of ITC maps Thoburn’s lifework and missionary career. Her initiatives provide a window into the historical and sociological paradigm of nineteenth-century colonial India, within which Western missionary women initiated “woman’s work for woman” in non-Christian cultures. In 2001, a hundred years since the death of Isabella Thoburn, it is appropriate to commemorate the important beginnings made by Western missionary women through cross-cultural initiatives for women’s higher education and professionalization. A short life-sketch of Isabella Thoburn, the founder-principal of ITC, who remained its matriarch and manager till her death in 1901, is thus an appropriate entry point into understanding how issues of gender, culture, religion, and higher education intermingled in the cross-cultural work of women missionaries.

Early Life in Ohio

Born on March 29, 1840, near St. Clairsville, Ohio, to a Scotch-Irish immigrant couple, Isabella was the ninth of ten children, and the fourth of five daughters. The Thoburns had settled in Ohio in 1825. In the homestead adjoining theirs there lived a family of Friends. The mothers in the two families shared a warm friendship, and Mrs. Thoburn named her fourth daughter after Mrs. Thoburn’s search for sponsorship coincided with the fur-lough of Dr. and Mrs. Edwin W. Parker, founders of the Methodist Episcopal missions in India. The Parkers’ accounts of missionary experiences in India, stressing the need for women missionaries, inspired Methodist churchwomen in Boston to convene a meeting on March 23, 1869. This group of six (some sources claim nine) women attendees decided to organize the Women’s Foreign Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church. Thoburn’s offer, presented at the first meeting of the society, was enthusiastically endorsed. Soon after, Clara Swain, M.D., a recent medical graduate, was also appointed for missionary work in India. This prompt recruitment of two candidates,
perceived as "capable, vigorous, practical and spiritual young women," indicated that the direction of the new venture was in the hands of "wise and capable managers."10 The sponsorship of Isabella Thoburn illustrates how the collaborative efforts of enthusiastic churchwomen, along with zealous single women volunteers offering their services, led to the founding of early women's foreign missionary societies in North America.11

Although Thoburn seemed convinced of her vocation, her anxieties are reflected in a letter to Mrs. Parker. "As I have anticipated this appointment, it seems all new and strange to me now that it has taken place, and I can see how such an ignorant child could have dared to expect such a trust. I know nothing at all, except to believe that if God has indeed chosen me to serve him in this way, he will not leave me unprepared for the service."12

In India, Setting the Ground Rules

Marking the beginning of a new phase in the history of Methodist missions overseas, Isabella Thoburn and Clara Swain sailed aboard the steamer Rome from Boston on November 3, 1869, and arrived in Bombay on January 7, 1870. Thoburn was assigned to Lucknow,13 where her brother was stationed, while Swain was assigned to work in Bareilly.

Initially, Thoburn was under the guardianship of her older brother, functioning as a sort of understudy. An amusing incident from her biography narrates how James Thoburn asked her to copy letters when he felt pressed for time. Although Isabella did them cheerfully, when her brother requested her assistance a second time, she gently reminded him that "a copyist would be a great assistance" to her as well. Isabella's challenge to her brother's gendered, stereotypical assumptions about the value of her time and work had a lasting impact. Writing about the incident several years later, James Thoburn recalled how through Isabella's response he came to recognize that he had been putting a high priority on all the work of the male missionaries but a "comparatively low estimate on all the work which the missionaries were not doing"; he saw that "woman's work" was typically viewed "at a discount." He came to realize that the mission's female personnel were also missionaries and that their work was "quite as important" as his own.14

Isabella's stance had unmistakable feminist implications. Her negotiation with her brother's assumptions reveals her own assertive personality, as much as it typifies the ways in which single women missionaries had to make spaces for themselves within the strongholds guarded by their missionary brethren.

From early on, Thoburn felt drawn to the community of Christian converts in India. She felt that Indian Christians, being "numerically so insignificant," were neglected by missionaries, who tended to concentrate on Hindus and Muslims. Thoburn clearly had a long-term vision of the evangelical project. Indian Christians, she argued, ought be an important focus of mission enterprise because "the ratio of increase of converts to Christian-
their wives and daughters to fill the classrooms of missionary schools.

After occupying makeshift quarters in the initial years, Thoburn's school was housed at Lal Bagh, a rather special piece of real estate, purchased from a local wealthy landowner. Over the years support from home congregations in American and wealthy Indian families sustained the school.

Thoburn took her first furlough after eight years, arriving in New York in April 1880. She returned to Lucknow early in 1882. From her post in India, she had contributed articles quite regularly to the Heathen Woman's Friend, and she continued to write for the magazine while on furlough. She often appealed to her American sisters, evoking the "limited privileges and dark prospects" of women in India. Although Thoburn was clearly sensitive to issues of race within the Christian community in India, the language of her appeals to home churches had all the trappings of stereotypical missionary rhetoric, which stressed the "darkness" and "ignorance" of "heathen" societies.

By the mid-1880s the school had received recognition by the colonial department of education, and its students had passed the matriculation examination. Almost naturally, there arose a demand for a collegiate program for the high school graduates. On July 12, 1886, Lucknow Women's College came into existence. It offered collegiate teaching in a few select subjects to prepare its students for the centralized university examination.22

Campaign for a Women's College

A few months earlier, in March 1886, Thoburn again left India on a furlough, this time for medical reasons. She sailed from Calcutta with her brother and his wife, taking a holiday in London, and arrived in the United States in May 1886. During this furlough, which lasted almost four years, Thoburn became active in deaconess work in Chicago and later in Ohio. She was convinced of the value of training women and aspired to introduce the deaconess movement to India. She took a course in nurse-deaconess training. On finishing the training, Thoburn helped to found the Elizabeth Ianible Deaconess Home and Training School in Cincinnati, Ohio.

She also launched her campaign for funding the new collegiate wing of the Lucknow school, making numerous public presentations and appeals to congregations in America. She wrote articles in missionary journals invoking Christian duty toward those she described as bound in the shackles of lesser faiths. "We need thoroughly educated teachers," she wrote, "and we need strong-minded women at the top, in order to lift up the great mass of ignorance below, and there is not a Christian Women's College in all the Empire. Shall we not have the first one at Lucknow?" Echoing mainstream missionary discourses, Thoburn threw down a challenge for mission enthusiasts: After the progress made by missionary high schools, could they "let others take the work out of our hands and put on the headstone where we have laid the foundation?"23

Thoburn's campaign meshed perfectly with the stereotypical missionary discourses of the day, positing binaries of the Christian as emancipating versus the non-Christian as steeped in the "thralldom of ignorance and superstition."24 As the first appointee of the Woman's Foreign Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, she was in a privileged position from the outset. With over a decade in India and a growing institution to her credit, she was perceived as having gained significant influence in the field and commanded a prestige hardly common for a woman schoolteacher in nineteenth-century United States. Overseas missionary work provided a space for professional fulfillment and earned Thoburn immense prestige with home churches. She addressed her American audiences with an ease and confidence that could not be matched by many of her sisters at home.

When Thoburn returned to India in 1890 she was appointed principal of the college, a post she retained until her death. One of her most significant contributions to the program of higher education at the college was the teacher's training program. This project first provided the opportunity to the women graduates to acquire a professional qualification. More important, it created a community of trained teachers who could branch out into other cities and create a multiplier effect through other institutions for female education.

By the mid-1890s enrollments for college-level courses rose, and a major upgrading seemed imperative. A new college building was needed, which had major financial implications. Thoburn was asked to visit her homeland to "represent the claims of the institution."25 As the founder, chief organizer, and an effective lobbyist for the institution, Thoburn set off on yet another fundraising mission to raise $20,000 for expansion and construction of new buildings. In the company of Lilavati Singh, her distinguished Indian pupil and protegée,26 Thoburn sailed for New York in March 1899. They left the United States in May 1900 to return to Lucknow. This was to be her last visit to the United States.

On her return to Lucknow, Thoburn found Bishop Parker seriously ill. The Parkers had long been mentor figures for Thoburn, and she had nursed the bishop through a long illness. Fearing that his end was near, Thoburn chose a burial spot for him at the local cemetery. Bishop Parker, however, did not die in Lucknow but in Naini Tal in June 1901. Thoburn's association with the Parkers had been a very special one, and at the bishop's death, for the first time, she assumed leadership in the presence of ministers. "Let us pray, she said. 'There is no death. It is all life, only life.'"27

Two months later, on August 31, Lilavati Singh was wakened by the news that Thoburn was ill. Lilavati found her in the grip of cholera. Around 8:00 P.M. the next evening, Isabella Thoburn breathed her last, surrounded by her family on campus—teachers, students, staff, and members of the Methodist community. She was buried in Lucknow at the very spot she had chosen for Bishop Parker. The following year (1902), the college was christened the Isabella Thoburn College (ITC).

Conclusion

Thoburn's commitment to women's education in the late nineteenth century reflected a conviction she shared with many North American women like herself, who were among the early beneficiaries of higher education for women in the United States. In her overseas missionary work, this commitment to female...
education was coupled with a concern to strengthen the community of newly converted Christians, who lived on the margins of mainstream society in South Asia.

For thirty-one years Lal Bagh, where the school was housed, was Thoburn’s home in India. She lived on-campus and was deeply involved in every detail of its organization, planning, and administration. As the founder-principal, she was also the chief voice of the institution for many years, an effective lobbyist and fund-raiser. Having carved a domain for herself as a professional and an administrator, Isabella Thoburn was able to function reasonably autonomous of the internal mission hierarchies that often subordinated the evangelical work done by women.28

Thoburn’s work in India illustrates how in societies where gender segregation was common, missions in the late nineteenth century were compelled to recognize the importance of women missionaries. The formation of women’s foreign missionary societies after the 1860s provided many single, educated women in United States, Britain, and Europe the opportunity to explore avenues for personal and professional growth overseas, even as they did “God’s work.” Working in cross-cultural contexts, missionary women—especially educated women professionals—found new opportunities in which their gender privileged them, giving them access to local female constituencies that their male colleagues were denied. Not surprisingly, within the male-dominated missionary structures, women like Thoburn came to command prestige as professionals and administrators as only their brethren had done before. For many missionary women educators and physicians, the overseas arena provided more avenues for professional fulfillment than the parent culture, where they struggled with patriarchies and male gatekeepers to enter both religious and professional institutions.

Notes


3. This article is part of a larger cross-cultural study of American missionary women in South Asia. It began as a personal search for me as a non-Christian Indian scholar of women’s history to understand the role of missionary women and their encounters with South Asian women who were their patients and pupils. As I turned to late-nineteenth-century missionary texts and biographies, I found them to be replete with images of “heathen” women “suffering” in the zenanas (secluded women’s quarters), ostensibly awaiting redemption through the agency of the white, Christian missionary. Alongside this Orientalizing “gaze” of missionary texts with their “othering” of diverse religious and cultural subjectivities, there were the narratives and reminiscences of South Asian women alumnae of missionary colleges who remembered their missionary teachers and mentors with a great deal of fondness and respect. These narratives did not mesh nicely with the themes of domination and oppression, and of resistance and subversion that my understanding of postcolonial theories of race and power pointed to. It seemed important to interrogate women’s missionary work in “other” cultures and to uncover the many contexts—historical, racial, social, and religious—in which this subject was wrapped. As the project grew I became convinced that scholarly assessment of cross-cultural missionary interventions must move beyond stereotypical Western and imperial categorizations of missionaries as “saviors” and of postcolonial indictments of missionaries as “busbodies” in order to uncover the complex dynamics that characterized “Christ’s work” in “heathen lands.”

4. Two of Isabella’s sisters were associated with mission work. One, Mrs. J. R. Mills, was the conference secretary of the Woman’s Foreign Missionary Society of the East Ohio Conference; the other, Mrs. Ellen Cowen, was the corresponding secretary of the Cincinnati Branch of the same society in 1902.

5. See Thoburn, Life, p. 46.

6. James Thoburn was appointed missionary to India by the Methodist Episcopal Church in 1859. Beginning work in Calcutta, he spent many years in North India, mostly in the region today known as Uttar Pradesh. When he wrote the letter to Isabella, James Thoburn was touring the Rohilkhand area, also in Uttar Pradesh. See William Henry Crawford, Thoburn and India (New York: Eaton & Mains, 1909); J. M. Thoburn, My Missionary Apprenticeship (New York: Phillips & Hunt, 1884, 1886).

7. Thoburn, Life, p. 34.

8. Ibid., pp. 35, 29.

9. Mrs. Parker’s full name appears differently in the available sources. She is referred to as Lois Lee Parker (Dimmit, Isabella Thoburn College, p. 31) and as Lois S. Parker (Fredrick Price, India Mission Jubilee of the Methodist Episcopal Church in Southern Asia [Calcutta: Methodist Publishing House, 1907], p. 118).


12. Isabella Thoburn to Mrs. Parker (1869), quoted in Thoburn, Life, p. 50.

13. Set on the banks of the Gomati River, Lucknow, with a population of more than 200,000, was among the largest inland cities in India at the time. Though it had suffered a setback during the 1857 Indian war of independence, it retained much of its early Oriental splendor with numerous palaces, domes, and minarets. For a study of colonial Lucknow, see Veena Talwar Oldenburg, The Making of Colonial Lucknow, 1856–1877 (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1984).

14. Isabella’s brother was forced “to reconsider the situation, and once and for all accept the fact that a Christian woman sent out into the field was a Christian missionary and that her time was as precious, her work as important, and her rights as sacred as those of the more conventional missionaries of the other sex.” Thoburn, My Missionary Apprenticeship, pp. 249–50; Oldham, Isabella Thoburn, pp. 20–21.


16. Ibid., p. 290. Missionary boarding schools catering to this section of the Christian community had a somewhat different curriculum. They were geared to training the girls in planting and reaping, visiting neighborhoods, and doing community service. They also included a strong dose of religious teaching. The Methodists ran such schools in various parts of Uttar Pradesh.


18. Ibid., p. 93.

19. The school at Kanpur catered to a recently created community of Indian Christians and Eurasians who wished for a school “less Oriental in style” than Thoburn’s school at Lucknow. During 1877, as joint principal of both the schools, Thoburn spent much time commuting between the two cities, often taking the night train and
traveling by economy third-class carriages. Later she assisted in the opening of a similar school on the hill station of Nainital, which was a summer retreat for missionaries and colonials. See Thoburn, Life, p. 127.

20. Ibid., p. 89.

21. Ibid., p. 275.

22. In late nineteenth-century colonial India, the early women's colleges began as primary or secondary schools. When the girls passed their high-school examination and at least a few chose to pursue further education, the school sought affiliation and permission from the nearest regional university to begin a collegiate department. The undergraduate curriculum was taught in-house to the young women aspirants who, given social mores, would not have joined the existing men's colleges. Sometimes there were as few as three or four women students. The college emerged as an institution as the students increased and passed the centralized university examination each year. Early women's colleges like the Isabella Thoburn College (Lucknow), Kinnaird College (Lahore), and Bethune College (Calcutta), all grew out of primary schools. They were not founded as colleges in the commonly understood sense of the word. Thus in the case of ITC, although the first few students registered for collegiate classes in July 1886, Thoburn's project to start collegiate classes obviously began earlier, and her campaign for resources had to be sustained in subsequent years in order to institutionalize these ad hoc beginnings.

23. Quoted in Thoburn, Life, p. 188. Heathen Woman's Friend was published by the Women's Foreign Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, North. It was renamed in 1896 as Woman's Missionary Friend (1896–1940); in 1940 it merged into Methodist Woman.


26. Lilavati Singh was an Indian Christian alumna of the Lucknow school and college who later served on its faculty. In the last years of Thoburn's life Lilavati was clearly her protégée, and she is referred to in most sources on Thoburn. See Thoburn, Life, pp. 320–21; Singh, Gender, Religion, and “Heathen Lands,” p. 260.

27. Isabella Thoburn, quoted in Dimmit, Isabella Thoburn College, p. 28.

28. I discuss this issue with reference to the work of missionary wives, which remained largely unacknowledged in mission reports and records. See Gender, Religion and “Heathen Lands,” pp. 77–97.

My Pilgrimage in Mission

Maria Rieckelman, M.M.

Cincinnati, Ohio, in 1927, was a great place and time for me to be born the “fifth kid” in a loving, middle-class, Catholic family. My two older sisters, two older brothers, and I were born within six years of each other, so we all grew up together. A brush with death as an infant due to a serious mastoid infection brought me particularly close to my family. I felt the love and care of the family right from my birth. As the youngest child, I had the great advantage of older siblings showing me the way to win Mom and Dad's approval. I learned quickly to become a good strategist! Strategic planning was one of God's gifts I would use one day to serve individuals and communities.

Being born in 1927 helped to shape my attitudes toward life. Europe and the United States were still recovering from the horrendous loss of life in World War I, and the world was hovering on the brink of the Great Depression. The depression came and only ended with World War II. We five kids grew up in this world climate and had everything we needed from Mom and Dad, especially their love, protection, and safety. We also learned to live simply with few luxuries; hand-me-down clothes were special.

My father and mother were born of second-generation Austrian/English and Irish immigrants respectively. They lived all their lives in Cincinnati, an Ohio River town, a burgeoning Midwest city of artisans, tradespeople, and industrial toolmakers. Dad was a college graduate. After military service in World War I, he worked in the booming family retail woolen business until 1950 and retired after thirty successful years (and before department stores began swallowing up the small trader). I remember him returning from month-long trips doing business with woolen salesmen in the West and Southwest. I was intrigued with accounts of his meetings with Native Americans, Mormons, and many kinds of interesting folks. I longed to travel with him and meet people who were different from me.

Mom was always at home. I loved to come home to the smell of something wonderful filling the kitchen, knowing I would find her there ready to listen to all my wild, troubling, and happy stories, and ever so wisely answer my really big questions. Our kitchen conversations are still among my best childhood memories.

School days were happy and successful for me. I became quite gregarious, exploring friendships beyond my neighborhood and family. Harry L. Cohen, a Jewish man who owned the five-and-ten-cent store in Hyde Park Square, became a great friend. Even now I remember how proud I felt when he accepted my invitation to be present at my First Communion. Harry was well known in the parish, and the First Communion of his little friend in St. Mary's was a very special occasion! His friendship and several Protestant playmates gave me an early experience and comfort with religious diversity long before I knew what ecumenism meant. They were my friends, and their love was fashioning me!

Stirrings of a Missionary Vocation

The Sisters of Charity of Cincinnati taught me in grade school and high school. This community had many Sisters who had been missionaries in South China. These women would visit us in school and tell us of the missions. During those grade school years we were all encouraged to save our pennies during Lent to ransom Chinese baby girls rescued and cared for by these missionaries. I was already beginning to think of missionary service.

Maria Rieckelman, M.M., M.D., has been a Maryknoll Sister since 1945. Her missionary career in the healing ministry was spent first as a medical doctor in Korea and Hong Kong and later as a cross-cultural psychiatrist in Hawaii. Since 1978 her ministry has expanded into holistic health, community and peacebuilding processes, leadership consultation, and retreats focused on spiritual renewal for missionaries throughout Asia, Africa, Latin America, and the United States.
My discovery during grade school of poor black people in rundown sections of the city upset me. Later my mother reminded me that I used to say that when I grew up, I would come to these slums and help to clean the streets and make life better for the poor people.

In the seventh grade we were always rewarded for completing our work well. Each Friday we would hear Sister Ursula Marie read us parts of a wonderful biography, *When the Sorghum Was High*. The story was about the life of Father Gerry Donovan, a Maryknoll missioner killed by bandits in China. It impressed me deeply. I wanted to spend my life in China or somewhere in Asia, even though I had no idea how that would happen. I began to read with fascination everything I could find about China, missionary work, and Maryknoll.

World War II quickly became the chief focus of all of our lives during my high school years. Soon after Pearl Harbor was attacked, all the older boys in our neighborhood began to be called into service, including my two brothers. That was the first major disruption in our home life, and a great worry to us all. During these war years I became involved in the leadership of the Catholic Students Mission Crusade. I learned more about areas attacked, all the older boys in our neighborhood began to be called into service, including my two brothers. That was the first major disruption in our home life, and a great worry to us all. During these war years I became involved in the leadership of the Catholic Students Mission Crusade. I learned more about areas.

Toward Maryknoll and Mission

During my senior year in high school, I heard of a young woman in our parish who intended to join Maryknoll. She changed her mind and became a cloistered Dominican instead. I remember thinking then that maybe I would go to Maryknoll in her place. This was a quantum, irrational vocational leap in my missionary search. Shortly afterward I was notified that I would be receiving a full scholarship to college to become a nurse like my big sister, something for which I had hoped. Now however, I knew my future was Maryknoll. My parents did not think this was a very wise choice, since I was so young. They missed my brothers who were serving in Europe. Also they felt I would make a much better missioner if I stayed with them for a while and received my college education first. They reluctantly respected my choice of Maryknoll, thinking (as I later learned) that I would never last through the two-year initial training period! They were almost right, but I persisted for the mysterious reasons that constitute a vocation rather than a logical career choice.

In those years the only real path available to a young Catholic woman who wished to be a missioner was to join a religious missionary community. Maryknoll was the first distinctly American response to the call to mission within the Catholic tradition. I learned happily that our foundress, Molly Rogers, was first inspired to serve the missions by young Protestant missioners she met at Smith College, where Molly was a graduate and later an instructor. That appealed to my ecumenical leanings even then. The Maryknoll Sisters epitomized the deep yearning I felt to follow the healing mission of Jesus especially to the poor and oppressed.

My early formation years in Maryknoll were difficult. Mission in the Orient among the poor was the horizon that kept me focused and able to endure some of the customs and regulations of religious life I found incomprehensible at that time. I was also quickly challenged and encouraged by new responsibilities of leadership and teamwork. Prayer and friendship more than anything else supported me as I learned to live with and through trying and testing times. Molly Rogers (Mother Mary Joseph) was alive and present to me in those years. She was a gift to me for the first ten years of my life in Maryknoll. Her wisdom, humor, common sense, and practical approach to mission convinced me that I was in the right place. I continued my journey into mission.

As I look back on those formation days, I can see the staying power of a vocational call that defies all logic. I now understand the creative potential of the discontinuities and losses that began to become part of my life pattern. Endings were becoming beginnings. I had passed up the opportunity to go to college in order to join Maryknoll in 1945. Two years later I was sent to college by Maryknoll to focus on premed studies and eventually to become a medical doctor. Medicine was a perfect fit for me, and it carried me forward in my missionary dream to work with the poor in the healing ministry of Jesus.

The rhythm of beginnings and endings continued. In the first year of medical school I was in a serious automobile accident. The nerves and bones of my right arm were seriously damaged. It became clear by the following year that I would never be a skillful surgeon because of permanent damage to the radial nerve. This accident turned out to be a blessing. It led me to Asia as a general practitioner in postwar Korea for several years and then on to Hong Kong to plan and build a general hospital for the refugees pouring in from China. Eventually physical limitations from this same accident made it especially practical to pursue valuable studies in adult and child psychiatry. I believe none of this would have happened if I had followed the path of surgery. Many of the so-called mishaps of my adult life created significant avenues of blessing in my missionary career.

Discoveries in Korea

My first mission assignment was to Korea, just after the Korean War. The people had suffered terribly and were desperately poor, yet courageous. I often wondered how they could sustain their hope and resourcefulness in the face of such great losses. I discovered that faith was their strength, but not the Christian faith I had known. The many devout Buddhists who visited our clinic taught me much about the goodness of other faith traditions, making me aware of God’s presence in unexpected ways.

One of my first emergency patients was a young Buddhist...
Christianity's World Mission would be less intimidating and more manageable if everyone spoke the same language, followed the same customs and viewed life the same way. That idyllic world, however, is not the world Christ calls us to engage.

The real world features at least a dozen major cultural families and more than 2,000 religions, 6,000 languages and 30,000 distinct societies and cultures. There are also an unknown (and shifting) number of sub-cultures, counter-cultures and peoples with their own distinct name, history and identity. Furthermore, secularization has transformed Western nations into "mission fields" once again.

Several fields of knowledge prepare the effective missionary to "exegete" the biblical text and people's cultural context. These literatures are as necessary, and as sophisticated, as the literatures that prepare physicians to make sense of an epidemic, or astronomers of a galaxy. Asbury's ESJ School will prepare you to understand the historical, cultural and religious contexts of the field of mission to which Christ has called you, and to serve, communicate and help grow the indigenous Church in that place.

So if you are interested in making sense of a piece of the world, and in helping its people make sense of the Christian gospel, call the admissions office today at 1-800-2-ASBURY or e-mail us at admissions_office@asburyseminary.edu.
man suffering in the last stages of liver cancer. He was terribly ill and weak, lying there on a stretcher; still his eyes shone with peace. From the few words of his that I could understand and his calm facial expression, it was clear to me that he was ready for death, and already anticipating the embrace of his loving, compassionate God. With a smile, he told me he was at peace and totally unafraid. We spoke of God and of death, and he only asked that his family and I be his gentle companions as he finished his journey. This young man, as well as other Buddhists I was to meet over the coming years, broke wide open for me the experience of God’s presence in these people, and—as I was beginning to know—in all people.

The Korean Association of Voluntary Agencies, with which my congregation was associated, brought together many Christian denominations working together in Korea to heal the wounds of war. We became brothers and sisters in the healing ministry, and gradually we discovered the Christ in each other. This was ten to fifteen years before my experience of any official ecumenical openness on the part of my Catholic tradition. My time in Korea was short but long enough to experience the deep faith and courage of a people that had been invaded, oppressed, and dislocated by the devastation of war; yet they were not overcome. They were cheerful, proud, strong survivors who taught me powerful lessons about God, faith, and a spirituality of hope. I grew quickly to love Korea and its people; to do medical work in that setting matched my missionary dream of following in the footsteps of the Galilean, the healing Jesus. I had already traveled a long way from the very conservative, political, and religious environment in Cincinnati, and indeed of my church upbringing in the United States.

Frustration in Hong Kong

The honeymoon I spent with the Korean people ended abruptly with serious illness. Subsequently I was assigned to Hong Kong. My strategy skills were employed to help plan, build, and administer a hospital for the destitute refugees pouring into the safe haven of Hong Kong in the late 1950s and early 1960s. At the time I was the only Maryknoll Sister with both the British and American medical credentials needed to fulfill such an assignment. The pain of leaving Korea, where I had already begun to feel at home, was balanced by the new challenges before me. Despite some similarities to Korea, Hong Kong was different in many unexpected ways. But my biggest challenge was joining a new group of Maryknoll Sisters. We were part of an urban swell of refugees in a colonial Asian city. Before the coming of the medical personnel, the Hong Kong Sisters were primarily teachers, used to the structured ways and procedures of an established school system. None of these Sisters had any medical experience or background. The introduction of new, medical personnel into this very structured, formal educational setting was a shock to our host community and extremely difficult for us medical folks trying to set up and run a new hospital. There were painful clashes immediately! I mention this situation because tension and conflict within the “home” community is so often the most unexpected, painful, and disillusioning dimension of the missionary’s life. It surely was for me.

Eventually these difficulties led to serious conflict between the various groupings and the leadership. As the actual leader of the medical group doing a new form of mission, I was often in conflict with the older leadership of the community. There were factions, misunderstanding, and fear. The outcome of it all was that I was asked to leave Hong Kong. This was the most painful event in my life so far, and was probably the most transformative as well. It freed me to live and speak the truth as I see it, claiming my own authority even when the consequences might lead to apparent failure. Happily within a short time following this disruption and departure, my part in it was vindicated. That was healing, a real blessing, but I never returned to Hong Kong for long-term ministry. Ironically, the assignment away from Hong Kong led me to new leadership challenges at our center in New York, and well beyond!

New Horizons as a Missionary

My unexpected return to the United States and my own culture brought me right into the tumultuous cultural and societal changes of the 1960s. My Catholic tradition was also experiencing the radical shifts flowing from the Second Vatican Council. Fresh challenges moved me into a new form of healing ministry, and they have continued to energize my life in mission these past thirty years.

While in Korea and Hong Kong, many missionaries, hospital staff, patients, and friends made me aware of a high incidence of organic and stress-related mental and emotional illnesses. During those years there were no psychiatrists available in either place. I helped as I could and often had my diagnostic and counseling gifts affirmed. A seed for the future had been planted. After a time in leadership at the Maryknoll Center, I went back to school!

While completing a five-year residency in adult and child psychiatry in a cross-cultural program for future ministry in Asia, I used this training in ways I had never anticipated. Communities and leadership groups of women and men of all faiths, especially Catholic women, began to ask for various kinds of workshops, seminars, and retreats. Dedicated people were trying to make sense of all the changes, to grow beyond life forms that had become obsolete, and to deal with outbreaks of violence in many parts of the mission world as well as the United States. I traveled all over the States and some forty countries around the world accompanying these women and men as they faced issues of interpersonal growth, leadership, trauma, and stress. More recently I have worked with others in the area of the human call to interconnectedness, highlighted by the women’s movement and ecological awareness.

Treasures Found on the Way

While the external paths of mission sent me in many directions, the inner journey of transformative learning, joy, and meaning brought me deeper into the mystery of “God with us.” I have discovered many spiritual treasures on my mission journey, and most of these have been special people in my life and mission. For more than seventy years these friends have accompanied me on this journey. All have been my companions, treasures found “on the way.” My parents were a special blessing; they raised me in a loving home. My mother was the ground of safety, trust, and love all the years of her life. Mom taught me to keep my perspective clear and to know that God’s love never fails. I was fortunate to have joined Maryknoll when our foundress, Molly Rogers, was still alive. Her wisdom, joy, compassion, and utterly common-sense approach to life and mission continue to inspire me in this present time of postmodern chaos and hope. Sister Mercy was a dear friend and medical doctor, a real mentor throughout the years. She lived her name “Mercy” with generous simplicity, truthfulness, and acceptance toward all, and
toward me. Many other people beyond my family and the Maryknoll community, too numerous to mention here, have also shared with me abundantly their wisdom, courage, clarity, and joy as we have journeyed together. Friendship has to be the most important sustaining feature of life. It is the basis of our mutual growth in faith.

Collegiality, collaboration, and partnership have replenished my energy for the journey. Over thirty years of friendship and collaboration with Fr. Jack Sullivan, a Maryknoll missioner in Hong Kong, has created a ministerial partnership, through which we have served people in more than forty countries. Mutuality, equality, shared commitment to mission in Maryknoll, and a redeeming humor born of faith have made our mutual ministry credible and helpful to other missionaries and friends.

I am grateful for the richness, companionship, and meaning these living treasures have given me along the way. They were not part of any planned choices but have been gifts along my journey in faith, mission, ministry, and Maryknoll. This has been a journey full of surprise meetings with our God hidden in every disconnection, loss, and trauma, as well as in joy, communion, and fulfillment.

Would I change anything of what has been? A part of me would like to erase the pain, the traumas, and the losses. But with each of these I have realized something of the wondrous mystery of God’s loving Spirit. I would not want to exchange any of this! I hope to spend the rest of my life cherishing and deepening my awareness of loving relationships with friends everywhere. I hope to continue journeying with friends and colleagues as we act together to seek and to struggle to make present the reign of God among us all. I am not sure where the journey is leading me but remain open to the discovery of God’s ongoing creation and love of our glorious universe.

---

The Legacy of William Milne

P. Richard Bohr

William Milne was born in 1785 at Kennethmont, Aberdeenshire, Scotland. After his father’s early death, Milne supported the family as a farmhand and carpenter while receiving an education from his mother and a Sabbath school. At sixteen, Milne sensed God’s “free grace” remitting the “eternal wrath” that he feared his previous indifference to religion and his “profane swearing” had surely incurred. Over the years, Milne left the Church of Scotland for the Congregational “Missionary Kirk” at neighboring Huntley, which endorsed the conviction of the Evangelical Awakening that Christians must extend the spiritual revival and social reform taking place at home to their non-Christian brothers and sisters abroad and thereby hasten the in-gathering of the imminent worldwide kingdom of God.

Gratitude for his own redemption, admiration for mission heroes like David Brainerd (1718–47), avid reading of the Missionary Magazine, and dedication to “the coming of Christ’s kingdom among the nations,” inspired Milne to become a foreign missionary, but not before earning enough money to secure his mother’s retirement. The London Missionary Society (LMS) accepted Milne in 1809, sent him to its seminary at Gosport, England, ordained him in 1812 as “missionary in the East,” and assigned him to work with Robert Morrison (1782–1834), the English last and boot-tree maker whom the LMS had sent in 1807 to China as Protestantism’s first missionary to the Chinese.

Eight decades before Morrison arrived in China, however, the imperial throne had banned Christianity as “the ruin of morals and of the human heart,” because it “neither holds spirits in veneration nor ancestors in reverence.” Since Morrison also served as Chinese translator to the British East India Company (EIC), he could reside but not openly proselytize in Canton’s tiny foreign trade enclave. Nor were the Catholic authorities in neighboring Macao sympathetic to Morrison’s desire to evangelize in that Portuguese colony. To prepare for China’s opening to Christ, Morrison’s task was to translate and publish the Bible, prepare Chinese-language materials for future LMS recruits, and establish a mission beachhead on China’s doorstep.

Developing a Mission Strategy

On July 4, 1813, Milne and his wife, Rachel Cowie (1783–1819), arrived in Macao. After studying Chinese with Morrison in Canton for several months, Milne distributed his mentor’s 1813 New Testament translation and preached among several overseas Chinese communities in Southeast Asia, where he also scouted the terrain for a new LMS mission station. Under Milne’s management (while Morrison continued to alternate between Canton and Macao) and free of Chinese government interference, he recommended Malacca as best suited to become a center of evangelism, education, and publication.

A traditional entrepôt between South and East Asia on the western Malay coast, Malacca (Melaka) was now a European port (alternating between Dutch and English administrations) friendly to Protestant missions. With 17,000 Muslim Malays, 4,000 Chinese, 2,000 Indians, and 2,000 Europeans and Eurasians, it was easily accessible to other Chinese settlements in Bangkok, Penang, Singapore, and Batavia (Jakarta). From Malacca, Milne claimed, the Word would spread among Southeast Asians and, through the overseas Chinese, into China itself.

In the spring of 1815 the Milnes arrived at Malacca with their young daughter and newborn twins. The British colonial government donated land for Milne’s mission near Malacca’s western gate. Milne threw himself into Chinese and Malay language study and began preaching in the Dutch church on Sundays. On street corners and in Chinese homes, shops, boats, and temples, Milne distributed the New Testament and explained evangelical faith in the following indigenous terms. God, “formless and invisible” and “Maker of the heavens and the earth, is the only true and living God, and there is none else.” God knows that people have sinned and deserve punishment. But because God is “merciful and gracious,” he sent Jesus, his only son, to “practice

P. Richard Bohr is Professor of History and Director of Asian Studies at the College of Saint Benedict and Saint John’s University, St. Joseph and Collegeville, Minnesota.

October 2001 173
virtue, and redeem ... [people] from their iniquities, in order that all who repent of their sins, and trust in Jesus, should obtain eternal life in heaven.” However, those “who do not receive his doctrines, but work iniquity, must go down to hell, (that is, earth’s prison) and suffer undefined punishment.”

Inquirers were told that in addition to grace, individual salvation required moral action. Milne therefore exhorted the Chinese to “seek God’s gracious favor; deal justly with all; let not the rich greedily oppress the poor, nor the poor discontentedly complain of their lot, for both rich and poor must shortly die.” He further admonished: “Parents, teach your children to read the sacred book—to write—to trust in Jesus Christ—to venerate the bodhisattva whose atoning power was based not in miraculous philosophy of the school of Confucius stressed such biblical virtues as filial piety, it also ignored monotheism, the sinfulness of disobeying God’s commandments, and the ability of common people (not merely China’s ancient sages) to participate in divine providence. Worse, Milne lamented, the Chinese saw Christ as a bodhisattva whose atoning power was based not in miraculous deeds but on fantasy, whose resurrection was simply an act of reincarnation, and whose sacrificial death was ignominious. Moreover, such Buddhist notions as transmigration of souls “confound the Christian doctrine of future retributions ...”

The missionary’s challenge, Milne concluded, was to win converts by finding points of contact between Confucianism and Christianity and by building a communal, educational, and publishing infrastructure in which to embody the Christian message.

Defining Mission Fundamentals

In January 1817 Milne completed the first phase of mission construction in Malacca. The compound included a chapel, where Milne held daily and Sabbath worship (consisting of prayers and homilies on Bible readings) in both Chinese and Malay. The mission also included a library of works in Chinese and English, a printing shop, and living quarters for missionaries, language assistants, translators, and printers.

In China, the Jesuits had proselytized the scholar-official elite before the emperors began proscribing Christianity. But Malacca’s Chinese elite were marginally educated merchants who resembled the targets of evangelical preaching, education, and good works back home. Realizing that the Malacca Chinese must become more literate in their own language to understand the written Word, Milne made education a top priority. In mid-August 1816, with contributions from British Army friends in Bengal, he converted a stable on the mission grounds into Asia’s first Christian “charity school” for poor Chinese boys. By mid-1818 Milne oversaw six such boys’ schools around Malacca—four for Chinese, one for Malay, and one for Indians—where local teachers taught the respective languages and literature as well as Western mathematics. Milne introduced a mentoring system in which older students tutored the younger ones according to fixed lesson plans and textbooks. Moreover, Milne accommodated local custom by opening new schools on “auspicious” days in the lunar calendar, introducing Christian themes in lessons on Confucian ethics and ritual, enticing students to worship services by first inviting their teachers, and composing a Christian catechism and prayers in indigenous terms.

In 1818 Morrison appointed Milne principal of the Anglo-Chinese College. This institution was to integrate Eastern and Western civilizations by teaching Chinese and Southeast Asian languages as well as the Confucian classics to Asia-based European boys, some of whom might become missionaries. And through courses in English, Scripture, philosophy, history, geography, mathematics, science, and (eventually) medicine, Morrison and Milne hoped that Asian students would not only come to see Christianity as the core of Western culture but also convert and become Protestant clergy, teachers, and social reformers. When the building (which Morrison funded from his own EIC salary) was completed in August 1820, the college included seven students (some were on scholarship), a dormitory, classrooms, a museum showcasing Chinese and Western antiquities, and a chapel, the daily services at which students were invited (but not compelled) to attend. Milne himself taught geography and Chinese languages as well as the Confucian classics to Asia-based students.

Milne hoped the Christian literature produced at Malacca would penetrate China via merchant vessels.
You’re Embarking on
THE JOURNEY OF LIFE.

You’ll be traveling to multicultural places whether you stay home or go abroad. We’ll help you pack your briefcase or suitcase with cross cultural communication, language and education. You can be an international business person, a professor, a linguist or one of a hundred professions. We’re more than missionary training. At Biola University’s School of Intercultural Studies, we’re your preparation for the journey of life. Your journey begins here. Call now for information. 800-652-4652

Programs
- BA or Minor in Intercultural Studies
- MA in Applied Linguistics
- Minor or Certificate in TESOL
- MA in Intercultural Studies
- MA in Intercultural Studies
- SIL/Wycliffe Linguistics program
- DMiss Doctorate of Missiology
- MA in TESOL
- PhD in Intercultural Education
Milne formed a bond with Liang Fa, whose background and spiritual crisis mirrored his own.

judged by Jesus, and sent to hell or heaven as God's kingdom draws near. Meanwhile, the conversion process is ongoing, Zhang insists. So the believer, cognizant of the reality of sin and the last judgment, constantly repents, confesses, forgives, rejects materialism, does not confuse transmigration of souls with resurrection, reforms behavior by following God's commandments, and reads the Bible and prays daily. God rewards prayer not materially but with forgiveness, cleansing of heart, and eternal salvation. Because Christian faith is nourished within community, Zhang believes, Chinese Christians are eager to share their faith with family and friends.

Bob Whyte has insightfully observed: “Too few missionaries were concerned to establish lasting friendships with Chinese.” Milne was among that minority; he formed an enduring bond with Liang Fa, the mission printer and contributor to the Indo-Chinese Gleaner, whose personal background and spiritual crisis mirrored Milne’s own. In fact, Liang had initially resisted Milne’s invitations to mission worship, fearing that the Buddha would “soon bring punishment and death on such an opponent of the gods.” But carving the woodblocks for Milne’s Life of Jesus in 1814 and exposure to the missionary’s pious demeanor coincided with Liang’s growing guilt over his earlier “drunkenness and other kindred vices,” including gambling, lust, cheating, and lying. Liang was not consoled by quiet sitting at home, sutra-reading at Malacca’s Goddess of Mercy temple, or the resident monk’s assurances of Western paradise because, Liang concluded, Buddhist ritual and self-cultivation lacked Christianity’s connection with God’s moral commandments, from which emerged the “virtuous act” needed to “obtain forgiveness.” After weekly Bible reading and prayer sessions with Milne, Liang became a Christian through a conversion scenario strikingly similar to the one played out in The Two Friends.

On November 3, 1816—as Liang acknowledged his sinful nature and vowed to repudiate idol worship, believe in Jesus’ atonement, follow God’s commandments, and act justly—Milne baptized him. (Milne accommodated Liang’s request to perform the rite precisely at noon to avoid the sun’s casting shadows on such a sacred ritual.) Liang subsequently thanked the Holy Spirit for casting out his “evil self.”

After studying Christianity part-time at the Anglo-Chinese College, Liang emulated Milne’s missionary example. In 1819 he visited his village near Canton, where he married and baptized his wife (the first known Chinese woman to be baptized a Protestant), preached, and published a tract denouncing his lineage’s idol worship. Soon, however, local officials confiscated the booklets, imprisoned Liang for defying the anti-Christian prohibition, and beat him on the soles of his feet with bamboo.

The following year, Liang returned to Malacca to publish the Morrison-Milne Bible. Sadly, his joyful anticipation of further study with Milne was thwarted. In March 1819 Milne’s beloved Rachel had succumbed to dysentery, becoming the first Protestant missionary wife to perish in Asia. Refusing to slow his work routine despite a worsening tuberculosis, Milne himself died on June 2, 1822. From its Orphan Fund, Malacca’s Dutch community supported Milne’s daughter and three sons, including William Charles (1815–63) who later joined the LMS and collaborated with John Robert Morrison (1814–43) in carrying on their fathers’ efforts to Christianize China.

Milne as Mission Pioneer

William Milne exemplifies the first generation of British evangelical missionaries, who, as Max Warren has noted, were buoyed by the democratic, moralistic values and social activism of their emerging “skilled mechanic” class in the early nineteenth century. Artisans such as William Carey, Morrison, and Milne were “inner-directed” improvisers who, with whatever Nonconformist education they could acquire, mastered difficult languages to plant Christianity—despite dangerous circumstances—into time-honored civilizations they came to admire.

As Carey did in his educational, translation, and publishing enterprise at Serampore, Morrison and Milne developed a mission strategy and infrastructure on China’s gateway designed to extend evangelical missions into the rest of Asia. The preaching, education, tract writing, and publication to which they dedicated themselves remain mainstays of Protestant missions today. During their remarkable nine-year partnership, Morrison and Milne approached mission through the prism of cultural interchange. Mingling freely with the overseas Chinese, Milne studied their religious life and their Confucianism; in their social ethics he found points of contact with evangelical morality. Working hard to find commonalities to win Chinese converts first to superior Western learning and then to Christianity, Milne’s accommodationist approach anticipates one of the most enduring aspects of Christian missions.

Milne pioneered Protestant elementary education in Asia, which became coeducational soon after his death. By 1836, for example, 220 boys and 120 girls were enrolled in Malacca’s LMS Chinese schools, with 120 boys and 60 girls in the Malay schools. In 1838 the LMS opened a school for adult Chinese women and in 1839 set up a boarding school for Chinese girls. Some graduates of Milne’s schools would, he hoped, seek higher education,
convert, and become Christian pastors and teachers. Among the 70 Anglo-Chinese College students in 1836, 19 chose baptism. The alumni of the school included Chinese government interpreters, clerks, merchants, shopkeepers, ship captains, a medical assistant, and a doctor of traditional medicine. By 1837 three students at the college were preparing for the Protestant ministry. In Malacca alone, there were 250 Chinese Christians in need of such indigenous clergy.

By the time he died in 1822, Milne had trained ten LMS missionaries in Chinese language and culture. In Malacca and elsewhere in Southeast Asia, these colleagues continued Milne’s emphasis on preaching, teaching, and publishing. By the time of Milne’s death, they had produced no less than 49 pamphlets on ever-modern printing presses. By 1867, seven years after all of China was opened to evangelism, Protestant missionaries had published 787 religious and secular tracts.

The LMS giant James Legge (1815–97) carried Milne’s innovations into a second generation of evangelical missions. Raised in Milne’s parish at Huntley, Legge had been led to missions through evangelical revivals, studied Chinese in London with LMS Malacca veteran Samuel Kidd (1799–1843), and was himself assigned to Malacca in 1840. Three years later Legge moved the mission to Hong Kong, one of six coastal enclaves that the First Opium War (1839–42) opened to global trade and Christianity. Convinced, like Milne, that “Confucianism is not antagonistic to Christianity,” Legge established coeducational boarding schools there to teach poor students the Confucian classics, knowledge, mathematics, and science. Having also moved the Anglo-Chinese College (of which he became principal in 1841) to Hong Kong, Legge hoped it would train Chinese Christian leaders able to plant Christianity throughout the treaty ports. But after realizing that the college was falling short in this effort, Legge closed it in 1856. Nevertheless, as Lindsay Ride, vice chancellor at the University of Hong Kong, observed a century later, the college remains the “forerunner of all the British colleges and universities that exist in the Far East to-day.”

Legge had also brought four Chinese Christians with him from Malacca, including Liang Fa and Ho Tsun-sheen (1817–71). While Legge and Ho wrote Bible commentaries and itinerated around Canton, evangelical ideas had already begun to penetrate China’s heartland, thanks to Liang Fa. In 1823 Morrison fulfilled Milne’s wish by ordaining Liang as the first Chinese evangelist. Among the villages around Canton, Liang distributed and preached on the Scriptures and Milne’s Two Friends, baptized dozens of Chinese, and even briefly established a Christian rural “charity school.” As mission evangelism, education, publication, and medicine continued to expand in Canton, Liang became a well-known pastor of several small congregations, two mission hospitals, and a chapel at his home in that city.

Liang is best remembered for authoring twenty-one Chinese-language tracts, the most celebrated of which is Good Words to Admonish the Age (1832). In it, Liang sought to explain Milne’s evangelical faith in Chinese terms and advocated China’s immediate conversion to missionary Christianity, because, he thought, the kingdom of God was more imminent than even Milne had supposed.

In 1837 Hong Xiuquan (1814–64) read Good Words, identified God as China’s authentic ruler described in the pre-Confucian

Noteworthy

**Personalia**

Tite Tiénotou, Chair of the Department of Mission and Evangelism and Professor of Theology of Mission, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, Deerfield, Illinois, has been appointed dean of the seminary. A contributing editor of the *International Bulletin of Missionary Research*, Tiénotou joined the Overseas Ministries Study Center Board of Trustees last year.

Ron Flaming, Executive Secretary of the Commission on Overseas Mission, General Conference Mennonite Church, has been appointed Director of International Programs for the Mennonite Central Committee, as of February 2002.

Darrell L. Whiteman, who joined the faculty of Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmore, Kentucky, in 1984, was named Dean of the E. Stanley Jones School of World Mission and Evangelism, effective July 1, 2001. He succeeded the retiring dean George G. Hunter, III. Whiteman, who has been editor of *Missiology: An International Review* since 1989, will be succeeded in that position by Terry Muck, in June 2002. Muck, former executive editor of *Christianity Today*, is Professor of Mission and World Religions at Asbury Seminary.


**Announcing**

In July 2001 Trinity Theological College, Singapore, launched the *Centre for the Study of Christianity in Asia* to facilitate in-depth research on the identity and role of the church in the Asian context. The center focuses on clarifying the church’s identity, mission priorities, methods, and strategies, and on leadership development. Hwa Yung, former principal of Seminari Theoloji, Malaysia, is the director. E-mail the center at csca@ttc.edu.sg.

A documentation and archives conference, sponsored by the *International Association of Catholic Missiologists* and the *International Association for Mission Studies*, will be held at the Pontifical Urban University, Rome, September 29 to October 6, 2002. With “Rescuing the Memory of Our Peoples” as their theme, archivists and documentalists from around the world will share experiences, review the impact of changing technology, and explore the effect of globalization on the documentation of the story of the church. Particular attention will be given to minority situations where the oral and written history of the memory of the poor is at risk. Contact John Roxborough, Knox College, Dunedin, New Zealand, at rescue@missionstudies.org, or visit www.missionstudies.org/rescue.
texts, and concluded that he himself was Jesus Christ’s younger brother. Hong’s monotheism was so literal that he denied Christ’s (and his own) divinity, denigrated the Trinity, and misunderstood the soul and other evangelical concepts. But by embracing moral transformation and iconoclastic reform activism as the antidote to the abuses of the imperial Confucian order, Hong unleashed the Taiping Rebellion (1851–64), the world’s bloodiest civil war, in which 20 to 40 million Chinese perished.

In the mid-1850s Hong claimed that, under his authority as God’s vice-regent, his theocratic “New Jerusalem” at Nanjing was the center of a universal, millennial Taiping Tianguo (Heavenly Kingdom of Great Peace). Hong engendered revolutionary discipline by superimposing the Ten Commandments and mandating gender equality, universal coeducation, social welfare, and communal land holding.24 Despite Hong’s embrace of Western Christians as his “brothers and sisters,” missionaries and Chinese Christians alike condemned his “Sinified” faith. Although no trace of Taiping religion survived, Christian ideas were linked with Chinese sectarianism well into the twentieth century.25

After the Taipings’ defeat, evangelical missions continued in China for another eighty-five years. But missionaries split over Milne’s accommodationism. On one side was the “liberal evangelical tradition” carried on by Legge, who—having discovered monotheism in pre-Confucian China—accommodated Christian belief to Chinese culture. On the other side were the nonaccommodationists who sought merely to “transplant Christian civilization within China.”26 Between these extremes, a Chinese Protestantism, independent of the missionaries, also developed.27 Containing many core evangelical beliefs, indigenous Chinese Christianity survives today, gathering more converts than at any time during the pre-1949 missionary period.

Notes

5. Quoted in Lindsay Ride, Robert Morrison: The Scholar and the Man (Hong Kong: Hong Kong Univ. Press, 1957), p. 12.
8. Ibid.
10. For a study of Milne’s educational endeavors, see Brian Harrison, Waiting for China: The Anglo-Chinese College at Malacca, 1818–1843, and Early Nineteenth-Century Missions (Hong Kong: Hong Kong Univ. Press, 1979).
12. For a biographical sketch of Medhurst, see Biographical Dictionary, pp. 451–52.
13. In his English-language writings, Milne denounced the growth of Chinese opium addiction, which he attributed to the East India Company’s increasing involvement in opium smuggling, see Philip, Life, pp. 428–35.
23. Ride, Robert Morrison, p. 22.

Selected Bibliography

The London Missionary Society materials are located at the Library of the School of Oriental and African Studies at the University of London.

Works by William Milne

1820 A Retrospect of the First Ten Years of the Protestant Mission to China. The Anglo-Chinese Press.

Works About William Milne


Book Reviews

In The Shadow of the Mahatma: Bishop V. S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India.


As a Rhodes scholar at Oxford in the early 1980s, Susan Billington Harper was challenged by the mission historian Bishop Stephen Nell “to fulfill his own dream of producing a critical scholarly biography of Bishop Azariah” (p. xv). Nell would be deeply satisfied with this exceptional biography. Thoroughly researched, written with verve, sympathetically presented, and richly contextual, In the Shadow of the Mahatma is a significant contribution to both the history of the church and the history of modern India.

During his years as bishop of Dornakal in Andra Pradesh, V. S. Azariah (1874-1945) was the leading Indian churchman and a major figure in the rising ecumenical movement. His contribution and reputation were almost lost amid the dynamic events of the newly independent state and the changing preoccupations of the church in India and beyond. Harper helps us recall this remarkable man, “a powerful and unforgettable example of Christian servanthood in troubled times.”

Recapturing the story of Azariah was a formidable task. An energetic church leader for almost fifty years, Azariah’s knowingly incomplete bibliography of published works covers twelve pages in this book. Harper tracked his papers, letters, and reports in multiple libraries in India, the United Kingdom and the United States. Many family letters, scrapbooks, and memorabilia remain with family members. Although most focused as “bishop of the villages,” Azariah traveled widely first as a YMCA secretary, then as Anglican bishop, finally as ecumenical spokesman. He participated in the major missionary and ecumenical conferences from Calcutta (1896), Shanghai (1907), and Edinburgh (1910) to Tambaram (1938). His correspondents included YMCA colleague Sherwood Eddy, his mentor Bishop Henry Whitehead of Madras, and an array of friends such as John R. Mott, J. Waskom Pickett, and Roland Allen. Harper interviewed dozens of individuals in reconstructing “the public life” and times of Azariah.

Much of the drama of Azariah’s life revolves around the momentous times in which he lived. The church in India was growing rapidly and increasingly determining its own governance. He founded the National Missionary Society in 1905 and became the first Indian Anglican bishop in 1912. He was a major leader and advocate of the process that culminated in the creation of the Church of South India in 1947. As evangelist and bishop, he participated in the “mass movements” that increased membership in the Diocese of Dornakal alone from 56,681 in 1912 to 225,000 in 1941. Harper says Azariah “was the most successful leader of grassroots movements of conversion to Christianity in South Asia in the early twentieth century.”

These movements aroused the concern of many Indian nationalists who assumed that an independent India required religious cohesion. The climax of this biography is the conflict with the “Mahatma,” Gandhi, over the question of conversion, particularly evangelizing the depressed classes. Gandhi publicly opposed aggressive evangelism. Azariah as evangelist and most prominent Indian Christian was deeply convinced of the Christian obligation to “carry the Gospel to unveganted regions.” In 1937 some well-meaning English and Indian Christian leaders thought some compromise possible if Azariah and Gandhi could only meet. The meeting was supposed to be off the record. No agreements were possible. Word did get out through several articles in World Dominion magazine written by the young missionary Donald McGavran. McGavran was not in the conversation but likely heard of the discussion from Waskom Pickett, a participant. Gandhi was incensed, Azariah embarrassed. McGavran apologized. These tensions of the 1930s, “the travail of the church,” continue in our time.

One of the special virtues of this biography is Harper’s highlighting the consistent piety and faithfulness of Azariah amid enormous pressures. The letters of the peripatetic bishop to his wife, Anbu, provide fascinating evidence of his character. Harper also recognizes that there is more to this man than could be covered in one volume. More could have been said about his preaching and writings as well as the roles he played as chair of the National Christian Council of India, within the house of bishops, and in ecumenical meetings.

In The Shadow of the Mahatma is essential reading for understanding the church in India. In the words of a hymn written and sung by the parishioners of Dornakal, Azariah was eulogized “our most respected Bishop.”

—John A. Lapp

John A. Lapp, Executive Secretary, Emeritus, of the Mennonite Central Committee, is the author of The Mennonite Church in India, 1898-1962 (Herald Press, 1972).

Gender, Religion, and “Heathen Lands.” American Missionary Women in South Asia, 1860s-1940s.


This volume is a welcome addition to the literature on women and mission. Its uniqueness lies in the perspective of the author, who is an Indian scholar fully conversant with recent theories on gender and colonialism. By relying on interviews with students from missionary-run, tertiary educational institutions, as well as on archival and secondary sources, Singh provides a nuanced study that transcends the typical orientalist paradigm of mission history. From the recollections of non-Christian women educated in premier missionary institutions, she discovers that their educations prepared them for high degrees of individual...
Singh reviews the history of missionary education from an Indian perspective, encouraged by their parents and with Christian humanitarianism. Rather, mentoring by missionary women created an elite class of Indian women whose leadership roles were consistent with the values encouraged by their parents and with Christian humanitarianism.

After a methodological introduction, Singh reviews the history of missionary wives in India, the discourse about the “other” as applied to “heathen” Indian women, and the roles of unmarried missionary educators and doctors. In particular, she examines the careers of Isabella Thoburn, founder of the first Christian college for women in India, and Ida Scudder, head of the Christian Medical College of Vellore. By putting the missionary contribution into the context of Indian reform movements regarding roles of women, she provides a balanced picture of the missionaries’ work.

Singh’s portrayal of the struggles of missionary wives is particularly insightful as to the difficulties of cross-cultural living. The historical development of women’s missionary roles is very well done. The only weakness in the book is Singh’s lack of knowledge of the wider missionary movement. In addition to making a few factual errors, she attributes the twentieth-century paradigm of indigenization to the failure of conversion in India, a stance that does not reflect a broad knowledge of the history of contextualization. Nevertheless, this book is a well-written, thoughtful, and rigorous portrayal of the meaning of missionary education for Indian women.

—Dana L. Robert

**OMSC**

**Doane Missionary Scholarships 2002–2003**

The Overseas Ministries Study Center announces the Doane Missionary Scholarships for 2002–2003. Two $3,000 scholarships will be awarded on a competitive basis to missionaries who apply for residence for eight months to a year with the intention of earning the OMSC Certificate in Mission Studies. The Certificate requires participation in fourteen or more of the weekly mission seminars at OMSC and the writing of a final paper reflecting on the awardee’s missionary experience in light of the studies undertaken at OMSC.

Applicants must meet the following requirements:

- Completion of at least one term in cross-cultural ministry
- Endorsement by mission agency or church
- Commitment to return to their place of ministry
- Residence at OMSC for eight months to a year
- Enrollment in OMSC Certificate in Mission Studies program

The OMSC Certificate program allows time for family responsibilities and some deputation. Families with children are welcome. OMSC’s Doane Hall and Great Commission Hall (below) offer fully furnished apartments ranging up to three bedrooms. Applications should be submitted as far in advance as possible. As an alternative to application for the 2002–2003 academic year, applicants may apply for the 2003 calendar year, so long as the Certificate program requirement for participation in at least fourteen seminars is met. Scholarship award will be distributed on a monthly basis after recipient is in residence. Application deadline: January 1, 2002. For further information contact Jonathan J. Bonk, Director, at:

**Overseas Ministries Study Center**

490 Prospect St.
New Haven, CT 06511 USA

Tel: (203) 624-6672
Fax: (203) 865-2857
live&learn@OMSC.org
www.OMSC.org

**Protestant Origins in India: Tamil Evangelical Christians, 1706–1835.**


Bartholomaeus Ziegenbalg and Heinrich Pluetschau, pietist missionaries representing the Danish Lutheran Church, arrived in Tranquebar in July 1706 and baptized their first converts, five slaves, in May of the following year. A scant five years later, according to Dennis Hudson in *Protestant Origins in India*, their mission had 202 members. By 1732 the number had grown to 1,478. While numbers are not everything, in this case they are compelling. A far more familiar story in the early history of evangelical missions, after all, is the one in which for years the number of converts roughly tracks the number of missionaries who die in their assignments.

Hudson looks primarily through the lens of the Indian Christians in telling this story of growth and indigenization of Christianity, and that is where his very significant contribution lies. The pietists were willing to train and rely upon native catechists and pastors to carry the Gospel beyond the local mission church and outside the Danish colony. Perhaps of even greater consequence, they allowed traditional caste separations to be built into the division of labor in the emerging church, and they provided room for traditional language, music, and styles of public expression. The pietist message and strategy, in other words, were closely adapted to the social, cultural, and material circumstances of Indians of diverse backgrounds.
In the next century, however, that very willingness to tolerate indigenous social distinctions and practices within the Christian community brought the pietists into sharp conflict with the "new" missionaries (of the Church Missionary Society), who insisted that Indian Christians must stand outside traditional Indian culture, in particular outside the caste system.

Hudson makes effective use of rare and elusive primary materials and of the work of other scholars. The result is an economical and coherent narrative that I found both engaging and provocative.

—Jon Miller

Jon Miller is Professor of Sociology at the University of Southern California in Los Angeles. His current research explores the ways nineteenth-century evangelical missions dealt with social, political, and economic controversies.

Muslims and Christians Face to Face.


Down through the centuries, Christians and Muslims have related to one another in ways that range from long periods of correct coexistence and friendly cooperation to periods of suspicion, rivalry, enmity, and warfare. When one analyzes the elements that have led—and on occasion still lead the communities today—to recrimination and violence, one finds that it is usually political, economic, social, and ethnic factors, as well as the universal human tendencies to greed, power, revenge, and pride, that are the primary motivations rather than the content or teachings of either religion. Nevertheless, the theological images by which Muslims have perceived Christians and Christian faith, and those by which Christians have perceived Muslims and Islam, cannot be dismissed as factors that have engendered animosity.

Zebiri’s work is not intended as a history of Christian-Muslim polemics but limits itself to the study of twentieth-century Muslim treatments of Christianity and contemporary Christian treatments of Islam. It brings together perceptions of modern Muslims and Christians who have written about each other’s religion, in some cases in a genuine effort to understand the other religion on its own terms, though perhaps more often as distorted versions of their own religious paths.

The purpose of this study, as Zebiri states it, is to "make it as difficult as possible for either Muslims or Christians to recoil at the other’s distorted or inaccurate perceptions, while remaining complacent about their own.” The views of more sensitive and irenic writers—Muslims like Muhammad Tamimi, Mahmoud Ayoub, Riffat Hassan, Fathi Osman, and Ali Merad, and Christians such as Kenneth Cragg, W. Montgomery Watt, Roger Arnaldez, David Kerr, and Yves Moubarac—form a balance to the harsher judgments of many of their coreligionists.

The basic issues treated are those in which Christians and Muslims have been most critical of the stance of the other: the ways Muslims and Christians view Jesus and Muhammad, understandings of the Bible and the Qur’an, revelation and prophecy, inspiration, sin and redemption, religion and state. The book thus serves as an excellent introduction to the study of Christian-Muslim intellectual relations in the twentieth century. Its extensive citations and bibliography make the work a useful tool for professors and students alike. If one were to make a criticism, it would be that Zebiri appears to be more familiar with sources in English and French

THE FIRST COMPREHENSIVE ACCOUNT OF CHRISTIANITY AS A WORLD RELIGION

History of the World Christian Movement

Volume I: Earliest Christianity to 1453

DALE T. IRVIN and SCOTT W. SUNQUIST

• A landmark in its unique approach to the history of Christianity
• An international publishing event, more than 5 years in the making
• Reviewed and shaped by a team of 43 consulting scholars

"Christian history is one of the great gaps in the education of most Christians and others in our culture, but it needs to be well researched, well presented and sensitively interpreted. The History of the World Christian Movement manages to achieve all this, and deserves to be taken up by academic and church courses as well as by the interested general public.”—Dwight Ford, Cambridge University

"The best recent extended up-dating of the history of the first fourteen-and-a-half centuries of global Christianity.”—Samuel Hugh Moffett, Princeton Theological Seminary

“This book tracks Christianity’s worldwide course with dogged resolve and ecumenical sympathy.”—Lamin Sanneh, Yale University

Illustrations and maps. Notes Bibliography, Subject and Names Indices. 512pp, maps, illustrations. 1-57075-396-2 paperback $30.00

A World of Books that Matter

At your bookseller or direct

ORBIS BOOKS
Maryknoll, NY 10545
1-800-258-5838

October 2001
than in the extensive writings that have appeared in European languages such as German, Italian and Dutch, or with Muslim writings in languages other than Arabic such as those in Turkish, Urdu, Persian, or Indonesian.

—Thomas Michel, S.J.

Religion and Dalit Liberation: An Examination of Perspectives.


John Webster is widely recognized as one of the leading exponents of Dalit history and theology. (Dalits are the so-called Untouchables within the Indian caste system.) He has taught history in India for several years and has firsthand knowledge of both the sociopolitical and the religiocultural movements within the Indian subcontinent.

While his first book traced the history of Dalit Christians, Webster explores the Dalit religion as such in this brief but dense book. He begins with “a fairly detailed case study of Dalit religion around the turn of the last century and a brief comparison with what contemporary observers noted about Dalit religion elsewhere in India at about that time” (p.15). This case study is followed by an insightful analysis of the view of religion of Dr. Ambedkar, a leading figure in the Dalit liberation movement. Webster explains with great care the social test to which Ambedkar put all religions of his day. The next chapter examines the way Dalit theologians have employed the thought of Ambedkar in the construction of their own theologies. The author clarifies how the thought of Ambedkar continues to serve as a source for Dalit theology without undermining the centrality of the Christ-event. In the following chapter the author offers us a survey of “the diverse ways in which religion has affected Dalit lives and the differences it has made.” (p. 99). The concluding chapter outlines four key concepts that have emerged in the study of Dalit religion: religion, conversion, identity, and liberation.

Though brief, Webster’s treatment of these four themes is very helpful to all those who wish to understand Dalit religion in India. One of the major strengths of the book is its consistent resistance to “any quick and easy reductionism in assessing either the Dalits themselves or the role(s) which religion can play in their liberation” (p. 99).

—M. Thomas Thangaraj

M. Thomas Thangaraj is the D. W. and Ruth Brooks Associate Professor of World Christianity, Candler School of Theology, Emory University, Atlanta.

The Saffron Mission


The Saffron Mission examines the cherished notion that Hinduism is not a missionary religion. The nineteenth-century Indologist Max Müller divided all world religions into two groups: missionary and nonmissionary. In the former category he placed Islam, Christianity, and Buddhism;
in the latter, Hinduism and Judaism. This paradigm has largely gone unchallenged. Mathew, who served as the dean of the Union Biblical Seminary in Pune, challenges this view by tracing the history of Hinduism in India from the nineteenth century to the present and demonstrates, quite convincingly, that there is much more to be said about a Hindu, or "saffron," than is commonly supposed.

After providing a general historical background, Mathew advances his thesis with an examination of the nineteenth century Hindu reform movement Arya Samaj, which had as its goal to "propagate the Vedic faith" (p. 65), as well as the Ramakrishna movement, which has been called the "world mission of Hinduism." Mathew examines the literature and history of these movements, highlighting their missionary nature. He demonstrates, for example, how the Ramakrishna mission is a global mission because it claims that all religions are contained within Hinduism.

In the final section of the book, Mathew broadens his thesis to include a wide range of modern nationalistic groups like the RSS and the VHP, which he characterizes as missionary. In order to sustain his thesis, Mathew is forced to equate nationalistic movements, which use Hinduism as a basis for promoting a particular ideology, with genuine missionary outreach. Competing religions are to be rooted out with missionary zeal because, in the end, "they "sabotage the unity and integrity" of India (p. 205). Overall, The Saffron Mission is a valuable study in the missionary efforts of modern Hinduism and the missionary implications of modern nationalistic movements.

—Timothy C. Tennent

Timothy C. Tennent is Associate Professor of World Missions at Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary. He has taught in India for over a decade and continues to serve as visiting professor at the Luther W. New, Jr., Theological College in Dehri Dun.


This first volume of the Handbook of Christianity in China is sure to be an indispensable reference work for decades to come. The modest title does not convey the scope and importance of this monumental work, which lucidly synthesizes the current scholarship on Christianity in China to 1800 (broadly conceived to include the missionary role in scientific and cultural exchange), contributes new insights in the process, and places at the reader's fingertips the essential reference tools to build on that foundation.

Each period of the three into which the work is divided (Tang, Yuan, and Ming-Qing, the last comprising almost nine-tenths of the work) is discussed under four headings: sources, actors, scene, and themes. The sources section provides analytic summaries of the main primary-source materials available for Christianity in China for that period and of the pertinent secondary scholarship. In the actors section are general sketches of the missionary bodies, the Chinese Christian communities, and the opponents of Christianity, plus biographies of key individuals. The scene section summarizes the social, political, and ecclesiastical context of Christianity in each period. Under themes fall encyclopedic articles on a wide variety of topics, ranging from...
missionary theology to the transmission into China of European learning and the transmission of ideas about China to Europe. Each essay in each section is concise, accessible to specialist and nonspecialist, and copiously referenced.

The Handbook is the work of some two dozen contributors, mostly European, under the editorship of Nicolas Standaert of the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven. Editorial care and a standard format have compensated for style differences among the contributors, resulting in a book that is consistently readable and packed with apt insights and fascinating details, even in the potentially dry sections. As one would expect in a work so immense, there are occasional typographical and grammatical errors, but these are few and unimportant. The cost of the volume is justified by its length and significance, and by the overall high production quality that Brill has brought to it. This book is unprecedented in scope and usefulness, an essential purchase for serious collections on missions and the history of Christianity, on China, or on the history of science.

—Ryan Dunch

Ryan Dunch is Assistant Professor in the Department of History and Classics at the University of Alberta, Edmonton, Canada, and the author of Fuzhou Protestants and the Making of a Modern China, 1857–1927 (Yale Univ. Press, 2001).


This is by far the most important collection in English of articles and addresses of Bishop K. H. Ting (Ding Guangxun, 1915–). Bishop Ting is one of the most important of China’s Protestant leaders in the last half of the twentieth century. Of Anglican background, he studied theology in Shanghai during the Japanese occupation, spent five years overseas (Canada, New York, Geneva), returned to China in 1951, and became principal of the Nanjing Theological Seminary in 1952. In 1956 he was consecrated Anglican bishop of Zhejiang. He has been a leading figure in the Protestant Three-Self Patriotic Movement and the Chinese Christian Council, and an articulate spokesman for these organizations in international circles, both in the late 1950s and since the reopening of churches and the relaxation of national religious policies after 1979. At the same time he has been an active apologist for Christianity to Chinese intellectual circles, justifying the legitimacy of religious faith in the Chinese socialist system.

Bishop Ting has been both admired and reviled in various Chinese and international Christian circles, and there has been much discussion of his role in the Chinese Protestant scene. Thus this collection is especially welcome, because it permits both scholars and foreign Christian groups to judge for themselves Bishop Ting’s positions and his argumentation. I think that many in international circles will be surprised at the vigor with which he has debated and defended religious faith in Marxist intellectual circles in China.

This collection of about eighty pieces, over seventy of them dating from 1980 or after, was originally published in Chinese in 1998 and was intended for a Chinese non-Christian audience. Janice Wickeri, the translator, is very able. Although the book has no index, its contents are very rich. The great majority of the pieces do not appear elsewhere, so this volume is indispensable. Copies can be obtained, at the U.S. dollar prices noted above, from the China Christian Council, 17 Da Jian Yin Xiang, Nanjing 210029, China.

—Daniel H. Bays

Daniel H. Bays is Professor of History, Emeritus, at the University of Kansas, and Professor of History at Calvin College. He is editor of Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present (Stanford Univ. Press, 1996).

The Missionary Outreach of the West Indian Church: Jamaican Baptist Missions to West Africa in the Nineteenth Century.


Horace Russell of Eastern Baptist Seminary, Philadelphia, is a Jamaican Baptist with an unrivaled knowledge of Jamaican Baptist history. This book is a revision of his Oxford University D.Phil.
thesis presented in the mid-1970s. It is a welcome addition to an expanding literature on the Baptist churches of the Caribbean, and the first published work devoted to telling the story of how, in the aftermath of emancipation, the Jamaican Baptist community initiated the West African mission of the Baptist Missionary Society.

Russell’s account contains two themes of wide significance. One, which he mentions only in passing, is the character of the spirituality of the Jamaican churches. The synthesis between an evangelicalism mediated from the southern states of America and West African religious traditions produced—a century before Azusa Street—a “Pentecostal” variety of Christianity, marked by glossolalia, the seeing of visions, and experiences of being possessed by the Spirit. The second and more central theme is the significance of the Jamaican Baptist case as an example of the priority of those of African descent in initiating the evangelization of West Africa in the nineteenth century. Russell’s message is, however, more ambiguous on this point than current historiographical fashions might wish. Enthusiasm in the Jamaican churches for the mission begun in 1841 was short lived, and British missionaries such as William Knibb appear to have been more convinced than Jamaicans themselves that the Africa mission was to be interpreted eschatologically as a return from exile or an exodus into the Promised Land.

Though stimulating in its subject matter, the book disappoints in its failure to take much account of the work on slave religion published since the 1970s and in the poor standard of its copyediting. The bibliography is full of mistakes, and there are many errors of substance in the text.

_Brian Stanley_
misunderstood the impact that Christianity would have on existing Chinese cultural beliefs and social practices. By actively seeking women converts and members of China's lower socioeconomic strata, Christianity challenged Confucian orthodoxy on the "correct" ordering of society. Is it any more frequent when imperial exams were being conducted? Second, try as they might, missionaries could not divorce themselves from their Western, imperialist roots. When missionaries sought redress for damages, they had to use Western, governmental intermediaries. Is it any wonder that the Chinese held a deeply seated distrust of Christian missionaries? This last point takes an interesting turn in Koen De Ridder's chapter "Congo in Gansu," where Scheut missionaries became "straw men" in the attempt of Belgium's King Leopold II to gain wealth from exploiting Chinese natural resources, since only missionaries could own land in China. Given Leopold's record in the Congo "Free State," one can only imagine what could have happened in China if the Qing Dynasty had been any weaker.

—Judith Liu

Judith Liu is Professor of Sociology, University of San Diego, San Diego, California.

Introduction to the Sociology of Missions.


This book is a worthy pioneering effort to make sociology as familiar and instrumentally useful to missiologists as anthropology. Having experience of both missionary work (in Taiwan) and the academy, Montgomery masterfully surveys the discipline of sociology and argues that it can profitably supplement—and sometimes correct—the contributions of anthropology.

He does so, after an opening chapter proposing the field of sociology of missions, by dealing with major areas of concern in sociology: social change theory, diffusion theory, missionaries and missions (a neglected field, he points out), religious movements, intergroup relations and social identity, sociology of religion, and several others. In each case he points out how awareness of that area would benefit missiology and what missiology could contribute in its turn.

He argues that in its use of sociology, missiology must go beyond mere description to theorizing. By this he means constructing not grand paradigms but "middle-range" theories, not far removed from the empirical data and heuristic hypotheses, but designed to explain phenomena in accordance with the canons of sociology, using the concepts of dependent and independent variables to sort out the social factors that contribute causally to specific phenomena in missions. Why, for instance, do some peoples respond positively and others negatively to the Gospel? A concluding appendix develops briefly ways in which sociology helps him do theology. He is consistent that theology, being inclusive, must incorporate empirical social reality, helpfully mediated by sociology, but that sociology, being limited, must not lapse into theology.

I have only two criticisms: first, Montgomery takes sociology for granted as limited but wholly benign; he does not acknowledge possible philosophical or theological problems. Second, I lack his confidence that other missiologists will respect the limitations of sociology as scrupulously as he does when they attempt to apply sociology in an "engineering" (his word, p. 3) manner in missions.

—Charles R. Taber

Charles R. Taber, a contributing editor, is Professor of World Mission, Emeritus, at Emmanuel School of Religion, Johnson City, Tennessee. He was a missionary (1952-60) in what became the Central African Republic, and a translations consultant of the United Bible Society (1969-73) in West Africa.

Subverting Hatred: The Challenge of Non-violence in Religious Traditions.


The editor of this volume, Daniel Smith-Christopher, is professor of theological studies and director of the Peace Studies program at Loyola Marymount University in Los Angeles. This timely set of essays responds to two questions: What are the teachings about nonviolence in the world's major religious traditions? and How have these teachings been exemplified? The book demonstrates that while the religions have made significant contributions to the ideals of peace and nonviolence, they have not consistently embodied those ideals.

Eight chapters focus on Jainism, Buddhism, Confucianism and Daoism, Hinduism, indigenous traditions of North America, Islam, modern Judaism, and Christianity. The essays place the teaching of nonviolence into the overall worldview of each tradition and then describe contemporary implications and expressions of the teaching. The epilogue by Donald Swearer reflects on worldview and practice, symbols and stories, inner peace and world peace, and the paradox of weakness and strength.

The essays on Buddhism, Hinduism, indigenous traditions, Judaism, and Christianity describe the tension between the ideal and the actual. They acknowledge that nonviolence is often a marginalized motif, set aside by the demands of maintaining order by force within a society and by the need to defend society against external threats. The essay on Islam points out that the nonviolent tradition in Islam is most clearly expressed among the Sufis, who form an "alternate community" within Islam.

Several essays describe practical implications of nonviolence for the contemporary world. Jeremy Milgrom suggests that within Judaism there is a way in which Palestinians could be recompensed for homes from which they were evicted. Christopher Chapple notes that Jainism invites people to "live sparingly and compassionately." Christopher Queen describes how Buddhist nonviolent activism is rooted in a "practical curriculum of skillful actions appropriate for taming and transforming the mind, serving others in society, and effecting compassionate social change."

—James N. Pankratz

James N. Pankratz is Academic Dean of the Mennonite Brethren Biblical Seminary, Fresno, California. A Canadian, he conducted doctoral research on Hinduism in Calcutta (1971-72) and served with Mennonite Central Committee in Bangladesh and India (1982-85).
Dissertation Notices

Jan S. Aritonang.
“The Encounter of the Batak People with Rheinische Missions-Gesellschaft in the Field of Education (1861–1940).”

Jonathan Edwin Culver.
“The Ishmael Promises in the Light of God’s Mission: Christian and Muslim Reflections.”

Judith Lynn Bartel Graner.
“The Shape of Synergy: A History of the Assemblies of God of Colombia.”

Benjamin L. Hegeman.
“Between Glory and Shame: A Historical and Systematic Study of Education and Leadership Training Models Among the Baatonu in North Benin.”

Marja Hinfelaar.
“Respectable and Responsible Women: Methodist and Roman Catholic Women’s Organizations in Harare, Zimbabwe (1919–1985).”

Arun Wayne Jones.
“Christian Missions in the American Empire: Episcopalians in Northern Luzon.”

Ancil Karikulam.

Sangkeun Kim.
“Strange Names of God: The Missionary Translation of the Divine Name and the Chinese Responses to Matteo Ricci’s Shangti in Late Ming China, 1583–1644.”

Sebastian Chang-Hoan Kim.

Paul V. Kollman.
Ph.D. Chicago, Ill.: Univ. of Chicago, 2001.

David Koudougueret.
“Literary Aesthetics and Bible Translation with Special Reference to the Translation of the Book of Genesis into the Sango Language.”

William Larousse.
Ph.D. Rome, Italy: Faculty of Missiology of the Pontificial Gregorian Univ., 2000.

Mark McClellan.
Ph.D. Fort Worth, Tex.: Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 2000.

Bernhard Ott.
“A Critical Analysis of Mission Training in Evangelical Bible Colleges and Seminaries in Germany and German-Speaking Switzerland from 1960–1995.”

George Abraham Thalothil.

David John Carl Zub.

October 2001
INDEX—VOLUME 25

January through October 2001

(paces 1-48 are in the January issue; pp. 49-96 in April; pp. 97-144 in July; and pp. 145-92 in October)

ARTICLES

Adrian Hastings Remembered, by Kevin Ward, 150-51.
Deyneka, Peter, J. [Obituary], 25:82.
Evangelism and Proselytism in Russia: Synonyms or Antonyms? by Mark Elliott, 25:72-75.
Hallencrutz, Carl F. [Obituary], 25:115.
Hastings, Adrian [Obituary], 25:115.
Kataliko, Emmanuel [Obituary], 25:12.
Miracles and Missions Revisited, by Gary B. McGee, 25:146-56.
 Müller, Karl [Obituary], 25:82.
Murray, Jocelyn M. [Obituary], 25:115.
Noteworthy, 25:12, 82, 115, 145.
Pike, Kenneth L. [Obituary], 25:82.
Samartha, Stanley J. [Obituary], 25:177.
Seunois, André [Obituary], 25:12.
Taylor, John V. [Obituary], 25:82.
Thomas, Kurien [Obituary], 25:82.
Verkuyl, Johannes [Obituary], 25:82.
Zago, Marcello [Obituary], 25:82.

CONTRIBUTORS OF ARTICLES

Elliott, Mark—Evangelism and Proselytism in Russia: Synonyms or Antonyms? 25:72-75.

BOOKS REVIEWED

Bourdeaux, Michael, and John Witte, Jr.—Proselytism and Orthodoxy in Russia: The New War for Souls, 25:44.
Eber, Irene, Sze-kar Wan, Knut Walf, eds. and Roman Malek, collab.—Bible in Modern China: The Literary and Intellectual Impact, 25:140.


Shorter, Aylward—African Culture, an Overview: Sociocultural Anthropology, 25:43-44.


Viswanathan, Gauri—Outside the Fold: Conversion, Modernity, and Belief, 25:89–90.


Webster, John C.B.—Religion and Dalit Liberation: An Examination of Perspectives, 25:182.


Witts, Diana, 25:131.


REVIEWERS

Akinade, Akintunde E., 25:142.
Anderson, Gerald H., 25:141–42.
Bays, Daniel H., 25:140, 184.
Brickner, David, 25:93–94.
Camp, Arnulf, 25:139.
Dunch, Ryan, 25:183–84.
Entenmann, Robert, 25:141.
Gilliland, Dean, 25:93.
Grant, Kevin, 25:86.
Iwaski, Ken, 25:42.
Larson, Warren F., 25:44.
Liu, Judith, 25:185–86.
Nehring, Andreas, 25:135.
Nemer, Lawrence, 25:42–43.

Pickard, William M., Jr., 25:139.
Popee, John S., 25:43–44.
Rader, Jr., Lyell M., 25:43.
Sawatsky, Walter, 25:44.
Schneider, Robert, 25:133–34.
Schreiter, Robert J., 25:36.
Stanley, Brian, 25:185–86.
Stuehrenberg, Paul F., 25:89.
Taber, Charles, 25:186.
Thomas, Nancy, 25:134.

Viswanathan, Gauri—Outside the Fold: Conversion, Modernity, and Belief, 25:89–90.
Walf, Knut, Irene Eber, Sze-kar Wan, ed., and Roman Malek, collab.—Bible in Modern China: The Literary and Intellectual Impact, 25:140.
Wan, Sze-kar, Irene Eber, Knut Walf, ed., and Roman Malek, collab.—Bible in Modern China: The Literary and Intellectual Impact, 25:140.
With, John, Jr., and Michael Bourdeaux—Proselytism and Orthodoxy in Russia: The New War for Souls, 25:44.
Woodberry, J. Dudley—Reaching the Resistant: Barriers and Bridges for Mission, 25:44.
Zebiri, Kate—Muslims and Christians Face to Face, 25:181–82.

DOCTORAL DISSERTATIONS


BOOK NOTES

On back page of each issue—48, 96, 144, 192.
Sharpen 
Your 
Mission Vision 
at

Spring OMSC Study Program Schedule

Jan. 21–25, 2002
Culture, Values, and Worldview: Anthropology for Mission Practice. Dr. Darrell L. Whiteman, Asbury Seminary, shows how our worldview and theology of culture affect cross-cultural mission. Cosponsored by American Baptist International Ministries. Eight sessions. $95

Jan. 28–Feb. 1
Ethnicity as Gift and Barrier: Human Identity and Christian Mission. Dr. Tite Tienou, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, works from firsthand experience in Africa to identify the cross-cultural challenges faced by the global church in mission. Cosponsored by Lutheran Church–Missouri Synod North American Missions, Mennonite Central Committee, SIM U.S.A., and United Methodist Board of Global Ministries. Eight sessions. $95

Feb. 25–Mar. 1

March 4–8
Spiritual Renewal in the Missionary Community. Dr. Maria Rieckelman, M.M., and Rev. Stanley W. Green, Mennonite Board of Missions, guide a time of personal renewal through biblical and community reflection. Cosponsored by General Conference Mennonite Church. Eight sessions. $95

Mar. 11–15
Christian Mission: What We Can Learn from Wisdom Traditions. Prof. Marlene DeNardo, Naropa University, Oakland, Calif., explores some wisdom traditions for insights and connections with the Christian message. Cosponsored by Maryknoll Mission Institute, and held at Maryknoll, New York. Eight sessions. $120

Mar. 18–22
Reaching Unreached Peoples: Updating Progress and Strategies. Dr. Michael Pocock, Dallas Seminary, offers evaluation and guidelines for making progress in fulfilling Jesus’ Great Commission. Cosponsored by Africa Inland Mission International. Eight sessions. $95

April 1–5
Christianity and Islam: Missionary Religions in Tension. Dr. David A. Kerr, Edinburgh University, guides Christians toward a sensitive and informed presence among Muslims. Cosponsored by F.M.M. Mission Resource Center, Reformed Church in America Mission Services, and United Church/Disciples of Christ Common Global Ministries Board. Eight sessions. $95

April 8–11
Culture, Interpersonal Conflict, and Christian Mission. Dr. Duane Elmer, Professor of International Studies, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, helps Christian workers strengthen interpersonal skills and resolve conflicts among colleagues and fellow believers. Cosponsored by Christian Reformed World Missions. Seven sessions, concluding Thursday. $85

April 11–13
Korean Missions in the 21st Century. Dr. Jung Woon Suh, former president, Presbyterian College and Theological Seminary, Seoul, Korea, leads a four-session seminar, Thursday evening through Saturday noon, conducted in the Korean language. Four sessions. $50.

April 15–19
In a World of Faiths, Why Jesus? Dr. Edward H. Schroeder, OMSC Senior Mission Scholar, former director of a program for laity in mission to secular culture, explores what is “good” and what is “new” about the Good News of Jesus Christ. Eight sessions. $95

April 22–26
Journeys of Faith. Canon Diana Witts, former missionary in East Africa and general secretary, Church Mission Society, explores links between selected biblical figures, present day nomadic peoples, and our own pilgrimages in mission. Cosponsored by St. John’s Episcopal Church (New Haven). Eight sessions. $95

April 29–May 3
Leadership, Fund-raising, and Donor Development for Mission. Mr. Rob Martin, First Fruit, Inc., Newport Beach, Calif., outlines steps for building the support base, including foundation funding, for mission. Eight sessions. $95

May 27–31
Good News in Urban Contexts. Dr. Robert Lupton, President, FCS Urban Ministries, Atlanta, leads a seminar on holistic urban ministries. Cosponsored by Lutheran Church–Missouri Synod, held at the Center for U.S. Missions, Concordia University, Irvine, Calif. Eight sessions. $95

Please send more information about these seminars:

NAME ___________________________________________
ADDRESS __________________________________________

(203) 624-6672 Fax (203) 865-2857
Registered online at www.OMSC.org

Overseas Ministries Study Center
490 Prospect St., New Haven, CT 06511

Publishers of INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN OF MISSIONARY RESEARCH
**Book Notes**

*Bediako, Kwame.*

*Braybrooke, Marcus.*

*Cruchley-Jones, Peter.*


*Kroeger, James H., general ed.*

*Larousse, William.*

*Lee, Philip, ed.*

*Lloyd-Sidle, Patricia, and Bonnie Sue Lewis, eds.*

*Ludwig, Frieder.*

*Presler, Titus.*

*Sachsenmaier, Dominic.*

*Synan, Vinson.*

*Wessels, Anton.*

---

**In Coming Issues**

*Christian Mission and Islamic Studies: Beyond Antithesis*
David A. Kerr

*Kenneth Cragg in Perspective: A Comparison with Temple Gairdner and Wilfred Cantwell Smith*
James A. Tebbe

**The Contribution of the “Jesus” Film to World Evangelization**
Paul A. Eshleman

**Brazil: “Evangelized” Giant Committed to Liberating Evangelism**
Sherron K. George

**The Lesslie Newbigin/Konrad Raiser Dialogue on Mission**
Michael Goheen

**From Jerusalem to Oxford: Mission as Foundation of Ecumenical Social Thought**
John Flett

In our Series on the Legacy of Outstanding Missionary Figures of the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries, articles about
Norman Anderson
Thomas Barclay
Rowland V. Bingham
Helène de Chappotin
Shoki Coe
François E. Daubanton
James Gilmour
Robert Reid Kalley
Hannah Kilham
George Leslie Mackay
Lesslie Newbigin
M. D. Opara
Constance E. Padwick
Julius Richter
Elizabeth Russell
Johannes Schütte, S.V.D.
William Shellabear
Bakht Singh
James Stephen
John V. Taylor
M. M. Thomas
William Cameron Townsend
Isabelle Lilias Trotter
Johannes Verkuyl
William Vories